CONTENTS

Research Papers

Tayyaba Tamim & Hana Tariq
Language Policy, Languages in Education and Physical Wellbeing

Mirza Muhammad Zubair Baig
The Question of Redemption in "Ghost" Lives in J. M. Coetzee’s

Aamir Shafi
Punjabi Parents’ Perception of Punjabi as their Children’s Mother Tongue

Maria Isabel Madróna García & Ana Berges
Etymological and String Analysis of Portuguese-Urdu Shared Vocabulary

Editorial Office
Quality Enhancement Cell,
Ghulam Ishaq Khan Institute of Engineering Sciences and Technology,
University of Engineering and Technology
Islamabad, Pakistan
Tel: +92-51-9257645 Ext 341 & 214

NUML JCI is indexed & abstracted by Proquest & Ebscohost

Subscription Rates (per issue)
Pakistan: Annual: PKR 500/-
Overseas: Annual: US$ 40
CONTENTS

Research Papers

Tayyaba Tamim & Hana Tariq ........................................ 1
Language Policy, Languages in Education and Physical Wellbeing

Mirza Muhammad Zubair Baig ........................................ 20
The Question of Reclamation of “Ghost” Lives in J. M. Coetzee’s Foe

Aamir Shafi .......................................................... 39
Punjabi Parents’ Perception of Punjabi as their Children’s Mother Tongue

María Isabel Maldonado García & Ana Borges ..................... 69
Etymological and String Analysis of Portuguese-Urdu Shared Vocabulary

Copyright Statement ..................................................... 86
Disclaimer ............................................................... 87
Call for Papers .......................................................... 88
Subscription Form ....................................................... 89
Editorial Board

Patron-in-Chief
Maj. Gen. (R) Masood Hassan HI (M)
Rector, National University of Modern Languages

Patron
Brig. Azam Jamal
DG, National University of Modern Languages

Editor
Dr. Farheen Ahmed Hashmi
Assistant Professor, Quality Enhancement Cell,
National University of Modern Languages

Editorial Board
Dr. Carl Leggo
Professor
Department of Language and Literacy Education,
University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada

Dr. Dawn Langley
Dean, General Education & Development Studies,
Piedmont Community College, Roxboro, NC, USA

Dr. John Gibbons
Adjunct Professor
School of Languages, Cultures and Linguistics,
Monash University, Malbourne, Australia

Dr. Phyllis Chew Ghim-Lian
Associate Professor (Tenure)
Department of English Language and Literature,
National Institute of Education, Singapore

Dr. Bernhard Kelle
Professor of Linguistics
University of Freiburg, Freiburg, Germany

Dr. Steven Talmy
Associate Professor
Department of Language & Literacy Education,
University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada

Dr. James Giles
Professor Emeritus
Department of English,
Northern Illinois University, DeKalb, USA
Dr. Haj Ross  
Professor  
Department of Linguistics and Technical, Communication, College of Arts & Science  
University of North Texas, USA

Dr. Robin Truth Goodman  
Professor  
The English Department,  
Florida State University, USA

Dr. Masood Ashraf Raja  
Associate Professor  
Department of English,  
College of Arts & Sciences,  
University of North Texas, USA

Dr. Ryan Skinnell  
Assistant Professor  
Department of English,  
College of Arts & Sciences,  
University of North Texas, USA

Dr. Samina Qadir  
Vice Chancellor  
Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan

Dr. Saeeda Assadullah Khan  
Former Vice Chancellor  
Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan

Dr. Riaz Hassan  
Dean, Faculty of Social Sciences,  
AIR University, Islamabad, Pakistan

Dr. Nelofer Halai  
Professor  
Institute for Educational Development,  
Agha Khan University, Karachi, Pakistan

Dr. Shahid Siddiqui  
Professor & Director  
Centre for Humanities and Social Sciences,  
Lahore School of Economics, Lahore, Pakistan
Contributors

Language Policy, Languages in Education and Physical Wellbeing

Dr. Tayyaba Tamim (Main Author) has her PhD in Education from University of Cambridge, as a fully funded RECOUP scholar and her Mphil from Cambridge University, as a British Council Chevenning scholar. In addition, she has a Masters degree in English Language Teaching from Kinnaird College for Women University and Masters in English Literature from the University of Punjab. She also has a Diploma in ELT from the University of Punjab. She has 18 years of experience of teaching at different levels. She is currently working as Associate Professor and Senior Research Fellow at the Centre for Humanities and Social Sciences & the Centre for Research in Economics and Business, Lahore School of Economics, Pakistan. Her areas of interest are education, languages in education and language policy with references to social justice across gender, class and caste. Her work involves the use of capability approach to human development and Pierre Bourdieu’ social critical theory.

Email: dr.tayyaba.tamim@gmail.com

Hana Tariq (Co-Author) is a student of MBA Finance at Lahore School of Economics. She has worked as Research Associate on different projects, including a recently completed World Bank and LSE funded project on Social Exclusion, Caste and Educational Opportunity in Rural Punjab. Apart from finance, her areas of interest are languages in education, health, and social justice with respect to class and caste.

Email: hana.tariq20@gmail.com

The Question of Reclamation of “Ghost” Lives in J.M. Coetzee’s Foe

Mirza Muhammad Zubair Baig is a research scholar at National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad. He works in the integrated areas of Postcolonial, Feminist, Poststructuralist and Deconstructivist Cultural Studies. His imagination is captured by the aesthetics of the margins. The art of writing back to the standardized texts, cultures, characters, metaphors and stereotypes is the site of resistance where he looks for the possibility of hope, equity, justice and empowerment of the othered.

Email: zubairbaig313@gmail.com
Punjabi Parents’ Perception of Punjabi as Their Children’s Mother Tongue

Aamir Shafi is currently working as an Assistant Professor of English at Government Shalimar College, Lahore. He has done his M. A. in TESL from Beaconhouse National University, Lahore and M. Phil. in Applied Linguistics from the University of Management and Technology, Lahore.

Email: amerschafi@yahoo.com

Etymological and String Analysis of Portuguese-Urdu Shared Vocabulary

Dr. María Isabel Maldonado García (Main Author) is an Assistant Professor/Incharge at Institute of Languages, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan. Her research interests include cross-language similarities, multilingualism, language phylo-genetics, socio-linguistics, historical linguistics, etymological science, and second language acquisition.

Email: spanishprofessor1@gmail.com

Ana Borges (Co-Author) is a Lecturer, Institute of Languages, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan. Her focus of interest in research is cross-language similarities, multilingualism, historical linguistics, and second language acquisition.

Email: ana_borges@live.com
Language Policy, Languages in Education and Physical Wellbeing

Tayyaba Tamim (Main Author)
Hana Tariq (Co-Author)

Abstract

The paper uses capability approach to human development as an evaluative framework to analyze the differential impacts of languages learnt in private and government schools on the valued dimension of participants' health and physical wellbeing. The findings discussed, in the paper, are a part of a wider 3-year qualitative study in urban Pakistan. The data emerging from 16 cases (each case comprising a final year secondary school student and his/her 5-6 year older same-sex siblings) reveal that poorly learnt English, against the perspective of wide use of English in the field of health in Pakistan, constrained the government school participants' range of choices regarding their physical wellbeing. Insensitivity to the linguistic diversity in the domain of health services and lack of linguistic capital of English restricted their agency to access health related information; participate in their management of health and make effective choices. The paper argues for acknowledging the linguistic diversity of Pakistan and making room for local languages in the provision of health services, while expanding the opportunities for learning English in Pakistan.

Keywords: health, languages in education, language policy, capability approach

Introduction

Language policies and the question of languages in education, in multilingual contexts, has been a subject of much debate because of the implications for resurrection of inequality (Pennycook, 1998; Rahman, 2006; Skutnab-Kangas, 1998; Tollefson, 1991). Languages are a subtle but potent tool of exclusion and discrimination (Bourdieu, 1991; Osama, 2012; Rahman, 2006; Tamim, 2013a; Tamim, 2013b). Robinson's (1996) study in African development perspective shows how ethnic and gender-based exclusion can result from the use of a certain language in development projects. A recent collection of sociolinguistic papers highlights the relationship of language choices and income poverty (Harbert, McConnell-Ginet, & Miller, 2008). However, there remains a gap for an integrated approach that conceptualizes languages in education and language policy in confluence with each other and explores it with reference to narrowly
defined poverty. Health, or physical wellbeing, is an important facet of multidimensional poverty that remains under-researched with reference to languages. Although studies in immigrant contexts in the West have highlighted the issue to some extent (Saal, 2011; Timmins, 2002; Wilson, 2005), the problem remains under-researched in home country context (Pakistan).

This paper contributes to the current literature by exploring the under-researched link between language policy, languages in education and relative poverty in the dimension of physical wellbeing in the multilingual context of Pakistan. The paper is based on some findings of a wider 3-year study, conducted in the urban Karachi (Sindh) and Lahore (Punjab). The question this paper explores is: How do languages learnt in private and government schools differentially affect participants’ range of choices to achieve physical wellbeing? The paper uses the evaluative framework of Amartya Sen’s capability approach to human development to conceptualize poverty as relative inequality in the range of choices or opportunities i.e. capabilities (Sen, 1990). The findings discussed in the paper are limited in the sense that these did not comprise the main area of inquiry but emerged as a significant theme during data analysis. Nevertheless, these findings highlight an important, but much ignored dimension of future research.

The paper is divided into six sections. The first provides the introduction. The following section gives an overview of literature. The third section discusses the theoretical framework and the fourth presents the context, followed by findings in the fifth section and discussion in the sixth. The paper concludes by summarizing the key points.

**Literature Review**

Language is a key semiotic mediational tool that facilitates communication. However, treatment of languages as a separate discipline, and its ubiquity in social interaction often leads to its invisibility in development-related discourse. Research on language and health is not only limited but also restricted to Western immigrant contexts. A systematic review of studies published in biomedical journals from 1990-2000, exploring language barriers in terms of access to health care, quality of care, and health status outcomes revealed a strong evidence that language acts as a barrier, adversely affecting access to care in 55% of the studies. In 86% of these studies there was an indication of “a significant detrimental effect of language barriers” on quality of care; while in two out of every three studies there was an indication of “language to be a risk factor for adverse outcomes” in terms of health, in one aspect or the other (p. 1). Timmins (2002) concluded that despite the presence of multilingual
communities, the health service system in California, United States was geared towards serving only the dominant language speakers. Yu, Nyman, Kogan, Huang, and Schwalberg (2005) in their study, using a bi-variant and multi-variant approach, analyzed the relationship between two key variables: level of English proficiency of the parents and access to health care that their children had. The study came to the conclusion that individuals who lacked knowledge of dominant language, remained poorly informed regarding health facilities provided by the state.

Singleton and Krause (2009) researched how culture and language could be taken into consideration for developing effective interaction patterns for health literacy. They found that the provision of health was intrinsically inter-connected with issues of communication in reaching out to a linguistically diverse population. According to their study, nurses played a crucial role in minimizing or maximizing the communication barrier in positive health outcomes. Another study, in South Africa concluded that when patients’ home language was used to communicate health issues, their level of comprehension was much higher than when any other language was used (Saal, 2011; Wilson, 2005). Metzger, Phillips and Greenfield (2007) in their study analyzed the effects of language discordance of (i) level of health education and (ii) quality of interpersonal care that the patients receive with patients’ satisfaction. The study led to the conclusion that language-based barriers between service providers and receivers in the health sector were associated with poor health education and low levels of patient satisfaction. The effect of the latter was not dispelled with the presence of a clinic interpreter. However, where concordance existed between patients and doctors, the patients were more satisfied with the consultation and displayed a greater understanding of their medical issue.

In another study, Wilson et al., (2005) conducted a telephonic survey of 1200 individuals in 11 languages, in California, United States. The survey aimed to study the link between English proficiency and medical comprehension through logistic regression. The findings revealed that limited English proficiency created difficulty in comprehension of medical information and exposed the patients to high risk of adverse medication effects. Respondents in this study indicated having problems in understanding their medical situations and trouble in grasping the medical terminology on the labels. These studies reveal significance of the relationship between language and health. However, being focused on culturally diverse immigrant communities in the West, they disclose little about the situation in Pakistani multilingual context.
Capability Approach: Agency, Choice, and Participation

Poverty, from a capability-based approach is essentially multidimensional. Hence it entails all physical, psychological and economic aspects of human life (Crocker, 2008). Correspondingly, the concept of wellbeing is also multifarious. The approach argues that rather than measuring equality in provision of resources, equality in social policies and institutions must be evaluated in the space of “capabilities” i.e. the range of freedom of choices and opportunities that these offer to individuals to achieve what they value (Sen, 1990). This is based on the realization that equality does not necessarily follow from the provision of the same resources because individuals, grounded in their own unique socio-cultural contexts, may require different resources to achieve the same valued goal. Hence, accounting for difference is the stepping stone towards an equitable society (Sen, 1983, 1990, 1999, 2000).

Freedom, incorporated in the concept of “capabilities” is based on a recognition of and respect for human agency (Sen, 1999, p. 69). Foregrounding human agency, allows the approach to conceptualize individuals as agents of change rather than passive recipients of aid (Sen, 1999). Agency is strongly connected to wellbeing but it is wider in meaning. While wellbeing is limited to one’s own improved condition where the individual appears more of a beneficiary, agency is concerned with the totality of wellbeing goals of self as well as the capability to contribute to the wellbeing of others (Alkire, 2002). In this sense, it captures the contribution of the individual to the society. Participation crystallizes individual agency, ultimately leading to “collective agency” of people for “rational scrutiny of options,” and positive social change (Crocker, 2008). Hence widening participation and inclusion lie at the core of social justice (Fraser, 2008) on which capability approach rests.

The act of choice and freedom to make a choice are of central concern to the capability approach. This is because making a choice is an act of agency and as such, intrinsically valuable to individuals. In addition, it is instrumentally significant for achievement of valued goals. Hence, mediated by agency, choice making is directly connected to individual wellbeing. The agency to make choices, however, is mediated by the sociocultural context, that may facilitate or inhibit its exercise (Ahearn, 2011). This explains the emphasis of capability approach on the choice making process and highlights two facets of capability: a) opportunity structure and b) development of skills. The first, we would argue, in the context of this paper, deals with the political economy of structures constructed by the language policy, while the second highlights the significance of education. Nussbaum (2000) focuses more on the first, while Sen (1990) on the other (Crocker, 2008), we argue for a confilation of
the two, as also suggested by Crocker. This is because choices can be meaningful only when there is congruence between the opportunity structure and individual skills of those involved. Hence, the necessity of considering the language policy and languages in education with reference to each other, in exploring language-based impacts in the domain of health.

Education is of crucial importance to capability approach for three main reasons: a) it has intrinsic value for individuals; b) it expands the range of effective opportunities for individuals; and c) it enables informed choice making. Hence, education mediates the achievement of valued goals through widening participation and access, while being intrinsically related to individual wellbeing. However, research puts forth evidence that such educational processes are not unproblematic (Unterhalter, 2005; Walker, 2007) and education can reproduce inequality, if inequitable (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977). Hence, there is a need to evaluate educational outcomes in terms of equality.

The Context

Pakistan is a multilingual country with more than 25 languages. Of these, Punjabi is the mother tongue of 44.15%; Pashto, 15.42%; Siraiki, 10.53%; Urdu, 7.57%; Sindhi, 4.10%; Baluchi, 3.57% and others, 4.66% (Census, 2001). Pakistan has a low literacy rate of 58% (Economic Survey Pakistan, 2012-13) with only 5% in higher education (Economic Survey Pakistan, 2011).

In Pakistan, since its independence from the British in 1947, English has retained its status as the official language, although it was Urdu that was declared to be the national language. Despite constitutional commitment to Urdu (Constitution, 1973, Article 125), English remains the language of prestige, used by the elite, bureaucracy, military, higher judiciary, higher education and in all-important official discourse. Regional languages stay in the lowest position in the linguistic hierarchy and hardly any role is ascribed to them by the national language policy.

Languages, as medium of instruction have been an issue of much debate among educationists and politicians of Pakistan, and the controversy has been acknowledged even in the latest National Education Policy (2009). Such arguments have been three dimensional: emphasis on home language for better conceptual learning; promotion of Urdu for national identity and solidarity; promotion of English because of its growing global significance. However, it is Urdu vs. English as the medium of instruction that has formed the locus of the arguments.
Currently, a large majority of private schools, in urban areas, offer English as the medium of instruction and teach Urdu, English and Sindhi (the latter only in the case of some schools preparing students for provincial matriculation examination, in Sindh). Being “English-medium” is flaunted as a display of quality by these schools to attract parents in this context (Tamim, 2010). However, the teaching and learning of the languages in these schools often correspond with their fee structure, with those charging higher fees also offering better English. Hence, English is handed over differentially across classes (Rahman, 2006).

The mainstream government schools, until 2012, with the exception of the province of Sindh, have been offering education in Urdu, with regional languages ascribed little role, if any, beyond primary level. In Sindh, the option of secondary schooling in the medium of Sindhi also exists in some government schools. The latest National Education Policy (NEP, 2009) re-affirms the constitutional right of provinces to promote their languages and select languages for use in education but restricts its use to grade V, after which, it declares that English will be the medium of instruction for Science and Mathematics (p. 28).

The decision was taken to cater to the increasing demand of English-medium education in the country, notwithstanding the poor English proficiency of the teachers. A government policy paper, states “There seems to be an increasing demand for English as medium of instruction in government schools but the schools lack institutional capacity to offer education through English” (National Report of Pakistan, 2008-09, p. 11). Currently, the government, with the assistance of British Council, is launching English language teacher training program. However, teacher training is only one of the problems. Another major issue, largely ignored in the planning of commoditized re-distribution of English, is that the language is almost foreign to a large majority of the poor that form the major part of the student population in these government schools. The conceptual challenge of schooling for these cannot be hard to imagine. More recently, given these issues, the government of Punjab, has rolled back its decision of shifting the medium of instruction from Urdu to English, and left the choice to individual schools. However, oblivious of such problems in Punjab, other provinces, for example, Khyber Pakhtoonkhawan (KPK) press ahead with English-medium education. Hence, with little research and informed decision making the confusion around the medium of instruction is far from being resolved.

Methodology

The study used a qualitative methodology and a multiple case study design. The 16 cases were pairs of siblings, educated from 3 public
and 4 private schools in Karachi (Sindh) and Lahore (Punjab) in Pakistan. Each case comprised final-year secondary school student and his/her 5-6 year older sibling of the same sex. This allowed studying of time-related processes, with reference to schooling choices, and language-based practices within schools and outside. Though, the case study design restricted the generalizability of its findings, it allowed an in-depth exploration of the issue, otherwise not possible (Pring, 2000).

The methods of data collection included: a) semi-structured, individual, ethnographic style interviews; b) participant observation; and c) documentary analysis. The three principles guiding data collection were: a) using of multiple sources of evidence; b) creating of a case study database; and c) maintaining a chain of evidence (Yin, 1984). It was the issues highlighted by the participants in the interview data that largely informed the collection of other data. The dimension of human development suggested by Alkire (2002) provided a flexible structure to the interviews (see Appendix A). The interview began with broad questions related to a specific domain, and the participants were encouraged to provide real life examples to validate their statements. A new domain was only introduced, if the participants had not commented on it earlier. This was only to remind if the participants wished to add something to their responses. The participants were not obliged to comment on each dimension. At the end of each individual interview, the researcher revisited the key responses with participant, listing them under each domain, to arrive at a mutually agreed interpretation.

The data analysis was guided by the constant comparative method of Strauss and Corbin (1998). Each interview was fully transcribed and line-by-line coding was done. This mainly comprised the terms used by the participants. The data was then revisited to merge initial codes into broader categories. This was followed by “axial coding,” to access more abstract categories, under each dimension of human development, identified by Alkire (2002). Finally, data across the cases was revisited and several detailed matrices were made. This led to the cyclical process of collapsing and emerging of earlier categories, until a coherent interpretation and explanation of the phenomena could be constructed. This was validated with evidence from other sources. Hence, the whole process of analysis though described here in a linear fashion was very much cyclical, leading to increased depth of interpretation, at the completion of each cycle.
Findings

Profile of the Participants

The private school participants (PSPs) had English-medium schooling and belonged to relatively stronger economic background than the government school participants (GSPs). The PSPs also had educated parents, who were supportive of their education. In contrast, all the government school participants (GSPs) reported low parental education. Four of the eight GSP cases, which formed the lowest income group, reported disruptive schooling journeys, as their parents attached little value to their education. The others with relatively higher income, however, did share with PSPs, a parental commitment to their education. Research has highlighted how these differences advantage the middle class children in terms of cognitive and verbal development (Bernstein, 1970; Lawton, 1968). Even if not seen in deterministic terms, it can hardly be denied that this social positioning placed the lowest income group of GSPs most disadvantageously. At the time of the data collection all the younger siblings were in the final year of secondary school. All the PSP elder siblings were in higher education. The low-income group of GSPs was in low-paid jobs (except one female who had started a small-scale business), while those with comparatively higher incomes, among GSPs, were in higher education.

At the end of secondary school, the participants’ self-reported learning of English corresponded to their socioeconomic background. All of the PSPs claimed having learnt English to a considerable extent, though only seven of them felt highly confident of their English skills. In contrast, the GSPs described their English skills as only minimal. The PSPs, invariably reported their Urdu as “poor,” while a majority of the GSPs reported learning Urdu. With the exception of one, none reported learning Sindhi from school. Significantly, those with the lowest income backgrounds benefited the least from schooling in terms of language learning. The findings, reported in this paper, are in the form of themes arising across the cases of two groups of government and private school participants, in relation to freedom of choices to achieve valued physical wellbeing and health. A discussion of intra-group and gender differences lie beyond the scope of this paper.

Physical Wellbeing, Languages and Choices

In the two urban areas of Karachi and Lahore, there was hardly any evidence of official use of regional language in the domain of health. Information collected at different private and public hospitals, revealed that English was the main medium of almost all documentation. The patient consent forms and other legal documents were also in English. In
privately run hospitals, the sign posting was mainly in English, only occasionally accompanied by Urdu. However, in government hospitals, more Urdu than English was used for the same purpose. In pamphlets for public health awareness, in these hospitals, though both English and Urdu was used, the information provided in English was often different from that given in Urdu. The English information was more detailed, while the information in Urdu was very basic. Despite limited collection of data, it was clear that English was the main language used in health related documentation, followed by Urdu. There was, however, hardly any use of regional languages.

The participants did not attribute any role to regional languages in their physical wellbeing. However, they felt the use of regional language, at times, generated a sense of bonding between the doctor and patient, when they belonged to the same ethnic background. In contrast, they ascribed a pivotal role to Urdu in maintaining their health. Both the groups felt that they received and understood most of the health-related information, through media and in Urdu. In addition, the doctor-patient communication also mainly took place in Urdu. Participants, with a mother tongue different from Urdu, especially appreciated the role Urdu, learnt from school, played in allowing them to facilitate the medical treatment of their parents, who could not speak the language. However, the subtle discrimination at work because of not knowing English did not go unnoticed by the participants.

All the participants felt that not knowing English constrained the agency of the government school participants (GSPs) to make informed choices, while expanding the range of choices available to the already privileged private school participants (PSPs). Rizwana (PSP) described how her English skills enabled her to make healthy choices related to her “diet,” “medication” and “cosmetics.” She pointed out, that the large variety of “off the shelf products available in the market” were mostly imported, and hardly ever, carried information in Urdu. She emphasized, “I can read through information and decide what suits me to avoid any adverse effect [or] to gain maximum benefit.” Tehmina (PSP) reported how her brother consulted a number of health magazines for his physical fitness regimes. She argued “these are available only in English,” and “only someone who knows English can access these magazines … although they are quite cheaply available [in second-hand book stores].”

The government school participants emphasized that the major bulk of health related information was in English, and the information in Urdu was only selective translation of the English text. Hence, they were denied the primary choice of what to know and what was important regarding their health. “Even a disposable syringe has English on it,”
commented Khalid (GSP), as he explained how not knowing English restricted his agency to make informed choices. Sameen (PSP) also related an incident of someone in her family, who suffered from the adverse effect from the intake of a medication, since she could not read the English literature accompanying the syrup.

Language and Access to Health-Related Information

Although GSPs considered Urdu as a major medium of their information regarding diseases like HIV, AIDS, Tuberculosis and Hepatitis C etc., several of them expressed a sense of vulnerability because they could not “fully understand what was going on [since] so much English is used,” commented Khalil. Adil (GSP) emphasized that even in Urdu programs televised on health, so many English terms are used that it is difficult to understand “we called them [the television station] and told them of our problem but they do not get it.”

Almost all of the GSPs had access to Internet cafes, which they frequented. “There is so much information [health-related] on the internet,” explained Asim but “we cannot understand English.” In contrast, PSPs related how their English enabled them to retrieve health-related information on the Internet. Farhan (PSP) felt his English empowered him to manage his father’s illness by exploring his illness-related information on the Internet. This enabled him to ask the doctor specific questions that facilitated managing of his health problems. “If I had not read about his illness on the Internet, the doctor would not have discussed things in half the detail he did.” Anyone, he believed, with poor English language skills, could never do the same. Where the participants reported low English proficiency, they also reported constantly switching between Urdu and English to process information. Misbah said, “There are so many things I cannot understand in Urdu then I read in English to understand like expiry dates.” This suggested poor language learning, while indicating that health related information if only in one language could be difficult to access.

Halima (PSP) described how she developed a “deeper understanding” of “dengue fever,” from a seminar at a medical college rather than just “fragmentary information” on the media. However, the use of English in these “free for all” seminars, subtly excluded from its participatory benefits, those who did not know English. Hence, from the opportunity to take control of their health, make informed choices and achieve physical wellbeing.

Partnership in Health Management: Doctor-Patient Communication

All the participants regarded Urdu as highly important in doctor-
patient communication. A few also suggested that the use of Sindhi created a sense of bonding between the doctor and the patient, if they shared the same ethno-linguistic background. Nevertheless, the PSPs, more confident of their English skills argued that if they discussed health issues with the doctors, in English, the latter responded in more detail and trusted them of being capable of handling in-depth information. Faraz (PSP) recalled taking his grandmother to a doctor with his father. He described the effect of his using English on the doctor. “I talked to him in English and the doctor would then just look at me and explain everything to me, although my father was also there.”

“The doctors also feel more comfortable in communicating in English because the medium of their education has been English, so it is easier for them to convey the information in the same,” explained Hira (PSP), a final year medical college graduate. Nevertheless, Hira emphasized the down side of the lack of regional language knowledge among the doctors. She reported that “the majority of the medical students and doctors at our hospital cannot speak Punjabi or understand it.” Referring to the common mode of borrowings from English into Urdu, she commented:

We only think we know Urdu but we don’t ... try it yourself and it is such an issue ... every word of English we speak is simply lost on them [patients from rural backgrounds] ... any word of English that slips through you is not there ... for them as good as never spoken. (Source: Interview PSP Lahore, 2008)

Samia (PSP), another final year medical student, in Sindh, explained that not knowing the regional language led to serious issues regarding diagnosis and management of the diseases when rural population turned to hospitals in urban areas for treatment. She explained, with reference to the government hospital where she worked: “We are just running about to find someone who can understand what they are saying ... or making wild guesses.” In such cases, patient compliance and trust important for effective diagnosis and health management could hardly have been achieved.

Discussion

The findings highlight the relationship between languages learnt within formal education and the agency to make informed choices participate in social processes and contribute to the wellbeing of self and others. English language skills emerged as an important factor in determining both the range of choices available to participants, for physical wellbeing, and exercise of individual agency to decrease health-related vulnerability. However, use of English can be clearly seen as only
one aspect of the issue. Another emerging aspect was that of health professionals’ lack of familiarity with regional languages, and their failure to connect effectively with the poorest, and the most vulnerable section of the population. This is an issue that remains unaddressed in the National Education Policy (NEP, 2008-09), and in other policy documents. Even if all the school going population acquires English, the issue of disconnect between the educated and the existing, large, illiterate, rural population in Pakistan, that may not have access to any of the dominant languages, will not be resolved. Alkire (2002) with reference to the “informed consent” of the patients, sought by doctors, argues that:

A patient is not a victim but a person with many activities, needs and values of which health is one. And the medical professional is not an expert in all things, but has a delimited area of knowledge and resources in relation to human health. (p. 147)

This means that the doctor and patient have to forge a partnership to manage the targeted illness, based on a relationship of trust. Even the concept of “informed consent” is based on the idea of balancing out the power equation between doctor and patient, and allowing the patient to understand, weigh options and make choices. This is hardly possible if the doctors and patients barely understand each other. Here, the pivotal mediational role of language becomes apparent. Language emerges as “a part of what constitutes these contexts rather than a separate and independent set of structures” (Pavlenko, 2002, p. 298). It can be seen, subtly resurrecting inequality, as the agency of the GSPs to make informed choices is restricted, while being extended to others.

Significantly, the results of this study are congruent with the findings of similar studies in the West. Timmin’s (2002) study in the context of USA revealed that the multilingual context stands ignored in the domain of health and the languages used in the field of health are primarily dominant. He also found that the choice of language affected different dimensions of health care. This was true in the current study in Pakistani context as well. In Pakistan, Urdu and English were the dominant languages in health sector. At times there was more use of English than Urdu. This was in strong contrast to the linguistic reality of the context, where English is an elite capital and its access to a majority of the population is limited in Pakistan. The findings also reveal issues of communication between doctors and patients, as indicated by other studies (Saal, 2011; Singleton & Krause, 2009; Yu et al., 2005); and limited access to health information, if English proficiency was low, as revealed by Wilson’s study (2005).
The results of the study showed that the concurrent processes of:
a) unequal opportunity to learn English; b) de-valuation of the language (Urdu) that the GSPs had learnt and which was almost the lingua franca in the country; c) lack of emphasis on the learning of regional languages in education; and d) dismissal of regional languages in the domain of health, excluded and marginalized the already disadvantaged GSPs, and by extension others with disadvantaged backgrounds, while enhancing the agency of the privileged. Language played a crucial role in limiting the participation of the GSPs in processes that could lead them towards better health management. This was evident in their subtle exclusion from health seminar conducted in English, their limited access to Internet and their inability to read medical literature accompanying medicines. Such instances of exclusion curtailed their informational base and limited the range of health-related choices GSPs could make. The power of English in the given context, also limited their agency to take control of their health, with the help of doctors, and likewise the agency of the doctors to contribute to the wellbeing of the poorest and most vulnerable population.

The findings support the claim that “agencies are always co-constructed,” and can only be realized “if the environment allows for such agency” (Pavlenko, 2002, p. 293). In ascribing a diminished role to Urdu and regional languages, in favor of English, the language policy perpetuates marginalization. It is significant, that while the studies cited in this paper, were in immigrant contexts of the West, the findings of the current research relate to a vast majority of the population, in home country context of Pakistan. Hence, the current language policy and languages in education policy fail to restore full citizenship rights to all, in terms of accessing, processing and utilizing health-related information, for achieving the valued goals of physical wellbeing. In marginalizing the role of Urdu, and regional languages, the national language policy and the languages in education policy fail to address the issues of inequality and instead force a large population into marginalization in the crucial domain of health.

Conclusion

The aim of the paper was to explore the relationship between languages in education, language policy and physical wellbeing, which is an important aspect of relative poverty. Equality, in the paper, was conceptualized in the space of “capabilities” i.e. the range of freedom of choices offered by social institutions and social policies, as suggested by Sen (1990). The findings revealed that the government school graduates remained marginalized in terms of their agency to fully participate, access information, and make informed choices to achieve their physical
wellbeing, despite completing secondary education. This resulted from poor learning of English, in contrast to the wide use of the language, in the domain of health. Hence, opportunity structures are shaped that subtly exclude not only the GSPs but by extension, also a large section of rural population, seeking health care in Urban areas, with little access to dominant languages. The redistribution of English, fails to address the problem in is entirety. Achieving equality requires acknowledging and accepting the multilingual diversity of the context. This means incorporating regional languages in education and moving towards a more inclusive language policy that ensures representation of regional languages in health services, for enhancing the agency of individuals to achieve their physical wellbeing. While the study may be limited in its findings, it puts forth an important area of future investigation in Pakistan.
References


Appendix A

Dimensions of Human Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowledge: Capability to use languages, access knowledge in formal and informal settings, and life-long learning. This includes accessing, participating, and pursuing in valued educational activities including use of technology.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Life (Health, Economic and Psychological Security): Capability to survive and being healthy, employability and capability to financially support self and family, being able to live with dignity and respect, and feeling secure and free of threat or humiliation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationships: Capability to build relationships based on mutual respect, affiliation and collaboration; social networking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excellence in Work: Being able to participate, enjoy and experience creativity; compete for promotions and recognition in work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control over Environment: Capability to control day to day issues; gain understanding and independence in matters confronted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation: Capability of being aware of political circumstances and making informed decisions; having a voice and being heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion/Spirituality: Capability to access multiple sources of religious information, and practicing religion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inner Peace: Being satisfied and contented (Many participants affiliated it with religion and psychological security).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from Alkire (2002)
The Question of Reclamation of “Ghost” Lives in J.M. Coetzee’s *Foe*

Mirza Muhammad Zubair Baig

Abstract

John Maxwell Coetzee’s *Foe* (1986) is a rewriting of Daniel Defoe’s *Robinson Crusoe* (1719). In this rewriting, the woman, Susan Barton, has attempted at the excavation of the “ghost” lives from the canonical text. The fight for reclamation and recognition of the excluded other has been partially successful as major part of their life narratives remain inaccessible even in the retelling. This rewriting works on the other as “bearer” or “maker” of meaning moving to and fro from the world of silence to speech and vice versa. Susan’s resistant voice to patriarchy and colonial master interrogates the classic text but her presence in the narrative is directly confronted by the oppressive patriarchy to the effect that her partial story is delivered stillborn and larger part remains inaccessible for the readers.

*Keywords:* canon, rewriting/retelling, patriarchy, colonialism, silences

Introduction

This essay explores how far the rewritings of the Western canonical texts could “re-right” the absences stereotyped in the patriarchal and colonial cultures. I have, particularly, focused on the feminist and postcolonial themes of voice, identity and representation of the marginalized. The imperial and patriarchal Other standardize the “lesser beings” of women and the colonized. The normative structures of canonicity mispresent and erase the objectified other to their advantage (Baig, 2012).

*Robinson Crusoe*’s story has been interrupted by Susan Barton’s narrative in *Foe* which is a rewriting of castaways, Susan Barton¹ and Friday; and challenges the representation of the other by the imperial Other. The narrative of heroic Crusoe has also been shared by a woman and Friday who reclaim their part of the adventure. At the same time, it is also the story of a kidnapped daughter and a missing mother.

Foe, the English writer, is shown in debt with diminished energies for writing. Susan faces a daughter looking for her missed mother and claims her (Susan) to be her mother who does not recognize the girl. It is revealed in the text that it is Foe’s move to interpolate a daughter looking for her lost mother in the plot of Susan’s story in order to make her story
palatable for the English readers. The mother-daughter relationship is in
trouble and the mystery of missing mother-daughter remains unresolved. I
analyse this intricate relationship under the heading “Madwoman looking
for her missed mother: Susan Barton’s double” in the analysis.

**Stereotyped Representation of Crusoe, Friday and a Woman**

Daniel Defoe’s *Robinson Crusoe* presents an Englishman, a farm
owner in Brazil, as deliverer of a “cannibal” named Friday. In an attempt to
make his career in slave trade, he sets sail to the Guinea Coast but is
shipwrecked and left marooned on an island for 35 years. Crusoe considers
his entrapment in island as punishment for his “original sin” (p. 214) of not
listening to his father (God) who wished him to stay as a planter in Brazil.
The chapter “I Find the Print of a Man’s Naked Foot” onwards represents
Friday, an arbitrary name given by the colonial master for the only reason
that he was “delivered” of the cannibals that day, “I let him know his name
should be Friday, which was the day I saved his life” (p. 227). Crusoe,
“banished from human society” and “condemned ... to silent life” (p. 174)
was “exceedingly surprised with the print of a man’s naked foot on the
shore” (p. 171) after spending eighteen years of his life of a recluse in the
woods. This “print” generates anxiety in Crusoe’s mind. He is afraid of non-
Englishness, “any human creature” (p. 181) who is not English. “Naked”
alludes to the stereotyped nakedness and savagery of cannibalism—
“horror of my mind” (p. 183). He imagines them in his English mind as
inhuman, creating “the horror of the degeneracy of human nature,” full of
“abominable and vitiated passions” (p. 189). He tries to understand how
“the wise Governor of all things (God) should give up any of His creatures
to such inhumanity; nay, to something so much below even brutality itself
as to devour its own kind” (p. 217). He dreams of capturing a “savage” and
taking him as his servant who had “kneed down” (p. 219) to him:

> I fancied myself able to manage one, nay, two or three
> savages, if I had them, so as to make them entirely slaves
to me, to do whatever I should direct them, and to prevent
> their being able at any time to do me any hurt. (p. 220)

The othered human beings are first turned into savages in the gaze of the
Other and later on, forced into bondage of slavery. Misrepresentation of
the other as “savage” has been used as ruse to enslave a free human
being. Crusoe acts as a demi-god—“governor” of the island—the name,
the captain of the ship calls him by. Friday, a “savage” is an antithesis of
Western misrepresentation of Indians even in the classic text—*Robinson
Crusoe*. This is how Friday is described in Crusoe’s gaze:

> He was a comely, handsome fellow, perfectly well made,
> with straight, strong limbs, not too large; tall, and well-
shaped; and, as I reckon, about twenty-six years of age. He had a very good countenance, not a fierce and surly aspect, but seemed to have something very manly in his face; and yet he had all the sweetness and softness of a European in his countenance, too, especially when he smiled ... The colour of his skin was not quite black ... that had in it something very agreeable, though not very easy to describe. His face was round and plump; his nose small, not flat, like the negroes; a very good mouth, thin lips, and his fine teeth well set, and as white as ivory. (p. 226)

His depiction is limited to physical aspects. Friday is measured from English imperialist standards which give him an identity distinct from Negroes. He describes Friday’s rites of slavery through language of signs. Friday is shown signaling “subjection, servitude, and submission imaginable” (p. 227). Crusoe teaches him English civilization but is dissatisfied to perceive that he was “still a cannibal in his nature” (p. 228). This confession questions the assimilationist “civilizing mission” of the colonialist. He calls Friday “my man” (p. 233) and takes him as his material possession. He replaces his concept of “one Benamuckee, that lived beyond all” (p. 238) with the Christian concept of God “greater God than their Benamuckee” (p. 238), and problematizes his concept of life after death—“the pretence of their old men going up to the mountains to say O to their god Benamuckee was a cheat” (p. 239). He presents Friday, a willing and adamant slave, pleading, “What you send Friday away for? Take kill Friday, no send Friday away” (p. 249). He is happy over being “rich in subjects” on the island visualising himself “like a King” (p. 264) taking the island as his “property” and “an undoubted right of dominion” acting as an absolute “lord and lawgiver” to his three subjects having different religions. His man Friday was a convert “Protestant, his father was a Pagan and a cannibal, and the Spaniard was a Papist” (p. 264). Finally, rescued from the “enchanted island” (p. 291), he decides to settle down accompanied by Friday—the “most faithful servant upon all occasions” (p. 306).

Crusoe leaves his “effects in some safe hands” of his old “friend the widow, who I knew was honest, and would be just to me” (p. 314) and he finally goes back to England. He thinks of “the poor widow, whose husband had been my first benefactor; and she, while it was in her power, my faithful steward and instructor” (p. 314). Crusoe has no record of his sea and land journals: “As I have troubled you with none of my sea journals so I shall trouble you now with none of my land journals” (p. 318). Even the narrator in Foe, Susan, challenges his island journals by informing the readers that he never kept any journals in the first place.
Crusoe shares how poor Friday was “really frightened” at the sight of “the mountains all covered with snow, and felt cold weather, which he had never seen or felt before in his life” (p. 319). The Spaniards were his successors on the island, his “new colony” (p. 335). The two men left on the island work like colonial agents in the absence of the master. He sends provisions to his agents:

From thence I touched at the Brazils, from whence I sent a bark, which I bought there, with more people to the island; and in it, besides other supplies, I sent seven women, being such as I found proper for service, or for wives to such as would take them. As to the Englishmen, I promised to send them some women from England, with a good cargo of necessaries, if they would apply themselves to planting—which I afterwards could not perform. (p. 336)

Even *Foe* failed to excavate the story of seven women exported to Crusoe’s island. Susan is the only woman who has come up to claim her story. If there are women other than Susan, their erasures in *Foe* raise serious questions. In the normative text, they have no right to representational voice because they do not deserve an identity in the recognized structures while being “some women.” The women have been presented here as equivalent to other supplies and necessities. They could be applied to certain tasks if considered “proper for service” or wives to the Englishmen who could take them and leave them. The application of women to “planting” also refers to the age of slavery when the child born of a master from a slave woman was also a slave. Based on this historical fact, it can be assumed that these women were to give birth to “slaves” required for labor on the newly imperialialized island. This servitude and disrespect parallel the indifference shown to the “savages.”

**Theoretical Perspective**

I test the point of contention found in the claims made by Homi K. Bhabha and Spivak regarding the recovery of voice. Bhabha claims that the native’s voice can be recovered unlike Spivak who thinks that the women as subaltern cannot speak in the colonized cultures and suffer more than their male counterparts because of their sex and gender. I understand that Bhabha and Spivak both take essentialist positions regarding the recovery of voice, identity and representation and I work in the in-between space existing between these two polemical views. In order to see if the re rewritings have further caused erasure and absences, I take both Spivak’s and Bhabha’s positions side by side in my analysis to see if the voice has been recovered or remains in the “shadow” (Spivak 1988, p. 287). Spivak (1985a) notes that there is “absence of a text that can ‘answer one back’
after the planned epistemic violence of the imperialist project” (p. 251). She analyses postcolonialism in the context of gender, closely studies the place of women and finds them further marginalized by the subservient patriarchy in the colonized society and the postcolonial narratives.

Contrary to Spivak, Bhabha talks of collective resistance. I use Bhabha’s concept of the “partial presence,” a way to subvert the colonial authority and imposed silence on the colonized in the presence of the colonial authority:

The voice of command is interrupted by questions that arise from these heterogeneous sites and circuits of power which, though momentarily “fixed” in the authoritative alignment of subjects, must continually be re-presented in the production of terror or fear. (1994, p. 116)

Bhabha (1994) understands that such interruptions and questions from within the colonialist discourse by the subaltern disrupt the “fixidity” and “authority” of the colonial masters. This leads to the reading “between the lines” and “seek to change the often coercive reality” (p. 121) of the master discourse. Bhabha’s idea of “hybrid moment” is closely related to the art of rewriting which is produced as a result of the interaction between the absence in the world of canonicity and the colonial/patriarchal “presence” which caused their erasure.

While referring to the art of rewriting and explaining Bhabha “hybrid moment,” Parry (2004) writes that “[f]or in the ‘hybrid moment’ what the native rewrites is not a copy of the colonialist original, but a qualitatively different thing-in-itself, where “misreadings” and “incongruities” expose the uncertainties and ambivalences of the colonialist text and deny it an authorizing presence” (p. 25). Here the exposure of “misreading” and “incongruities” challenge the “authorizing presence” of the colonial presence of the colonial power. It is a resistance shown from within a text and narrative. However, the “misreadings” and “incongruities” also exist in the rewritings and, hence, also sometimes challenge the “authorizing presence” of the postcolonial and feminist narrator. The need arises to read the rewritings further and see if the native voice itself is interrupted by the questions from the internal audience of patriarchy/colonialism, and the other characters of women/the colonized.

Spivak (1985b) further claims that subalterns cannot speak as they have been “domesticated” (p. 253) by the process of imperialism. I understand that in the rewritings, re-righting is “partial” and character specific but the existence of characters in the “shadow” of the narration is a digression from its status as rewriting of the erasures. In the process of
historical excavation, there are characters which have been marginalized; they either don’t find sufficient space in the text or are consciously left out as insignificant.

Spivak (1986) provides the post-colonial woman intellectual the leading role to give representation to subaltern women by using the resources of deconstruction “in the service of reading” to develop a strategy rather than a theory of reading that might be a critique of imperialism” (p. 230). Therefore, the deconstructive study of the rewritings helps in not only listening to the exclusions in the classic texts but also keeps us vigilant to those arising in the rewritings.

The rewritings are an effort to put the erased characters “in the position of the questioning subject” that challenge colonialism and phallocentrism and, to Spivak (1990), such positions are “very privileged positions” as compared to “the much larger female constituency” (p. 42) who rarely get a chance to respond or get the position of a speaking subject. In case of my study, it is contradictory as the privileged position of the speaking subjects in the rewriting is also limited by their stereotypes in the traditional texts. Spivak requires from the feminist rewriters as the speaking and constituting subject to learn about “the unlearning of one’s privilege as loss” (MacLean & Donna, 2005, p. 5). Loss and lack has been historically associated with a woman. The women can take up this “loss,” erasures, absences and silences reserved as of a woman’s “privilege” and “unlearn” it by facing and confronting it. By submitting, learning and accepting this “loss” as “privilege” would silence them further so, in order to fight back, the rewriters are to challenge their mispresentations. This “unlearning” enables a rewriter “to listen to that other constituency”—the rest of women to “recognize that the position of the speaking subject within theory can be an historically powerful position when it wants the other actually to be able to answer back” (Spivak, 1990, p. 42).

The subjects of narration are in privileged position than the other subjected characters but, if they are women or the colonized, they are equally confronted and resisted by the colonial and patriarchal voice. Moreover, the narrative voice in the rewritings would have to “unlearn” its “speaking subject” position in order to let the other women and the colonized to “answer back” and respond to their presentation in the text.

**Susan Barton’s Exclusion and Partial Presence in Rewriting**

Susan Barton, the narrator of *Foe*, has been the “excluded other” (Spivak, 1987, p. 129) in *Robinson Crusoe*. She reclaims her erased self in Crusoe’s story. As it happens in case of standardized sea adventures, she is on a voyage, cast away by the mutineers of a ship and drifted to an island. She recounts:
At last I could row no further ... A dark shadow fell upon me, not of a cloud but of a man with a dazzling halo about him. “Castaway,” I said with my thick dry tongue. “I am cast away. I am all alone.” And I held out my sore hands. (Foe, p. 5)

Susan is binary to Cruso⁴ and Friday at the island and rows “all alone” to the island, but it is paradoxical that the moment she is washed up by the sea, her loneliness is interrupted by Friday’s presence and still, as a woman, she is “alone” on the “man”-rich island. Friday saves her life when Cruso makes her his subject. Though both Friday and Cruso are men, their reaction to Susan is quite differently contextualized by their master-salve relationship. As a “cast away” voyager, she is accepted only as a slave at the island. In the actual story, she has been an erasure and absence in Crusoe’s presence. With “dry tongue” and “sore hands,” the castaway, this time, is a woman instead of a European man Crusoe. “A dark shadow” and “dazzling halo” alludes to Cruso’s Friday. Holding out “sore hands” invokes the image of crucifixion. The “sore hands” of the castaway woman are comparable to the “dark shadow” of enslaved Friday, and carry the mark of their varying experiences and identities.

The narrative voice explains Susan’s experience as a “castaway” on a man’s island. Like Friday, she succeeds a man (Cruso) on the island whose arrival at the island before her gives him the opportunity to declare himself a master. Being a successor, she becomes a subject washed up by sea on the island. Her incapacity to “row no further” shows her dissipated energies as a woman and castaway “all alone” without an escort, braving the ship wrecking waves of the sea and finally surviving them. Susan Barton has been a “castaway” specifically in the Western text when she could not get her place in Daniel Defoe’s story of a eulogized European. This indicates how acts giving power to a woman remain untold in the stereotyped stories. This is how a patriarchal thinking pattern portrays a woman as weak, lacking the power to venture beyond on her own resources. As it is stereotypical in the adventure stories, she is also exposed to danger by a “dark shadow” of a man in a “strange island.” The character of Susan is a missing link in the European story, and her presence in the rewriting connects the “island” of patriarchy and colonialism to feminism and postcolonialism.

Her depiction of Friday as “shadow” can be connected to Spivak’s stand that “subaltern” are pushed in the “shadow” of the narrative⁵ and hence, cannot speak. In Spivak’s context, Susan as a woman is an “object of colonialist historiography” and “subaltern.” In her understanding, in the colonialist representation of the resistance (read “insurgence” from colonial angle) offered by the marginalized, the colonized part of
patriarchy further overshadows women because of “the ideological construction of gender” (Spivak, 1988, p. 287). Spivak’s “gender” specific argument carries weight as far as the representation of Susan in Robinson Crusoe is concerned. In Foe, though Susan is an agency to the narrative in the text, Friday, a colonized male, appears as a “shadow” and his gender is hardly of any advantage to him. Her image of crucifixion does not symbolize sacrifice, ending up or giving up but reflects her capacity to bear pain, face ordeals on her way, and foretells the life of trials awaiting.

Susan’s rowing to Cruso’s island is intentional and ordained by the structure of male writing. She could not find another island where she could survive on her own, and present to the world an island parallel and alternative to that of Cruso. Her story is fragmentary. It starts with Friday and Cruso somewhere from the middle of her life narrative — breaking her life apart where her voice prior to the island part goes unrecorded.

She stands up in the story to reclaim herself by speaking up to the patriarchy that had stricken the world of standardized writing. Susan’s inclusion in Foe justifies the cause of rewriting which is primarily focused on her. She is flanked by Friday. Macaskill and Colleran (1992) take the introduction of Susan in the narrative as a “maneuver”:

As a first demographic maneuver, Coetzee enlarges Robinson Crusoe’s kingdom by one, adding a castaway woman, Susan Barton, to the island’s only other subject, slave Friday; it is Susan Barton who elects to confess the story of the life and times of the island-empire’s last days. (p. 436)

To add to their understanding, I argue that Susan, being the only resident woman, not only “enlarges” Crusoe’s kingdom but also the “kingdom” of normative writing. She does so by not being a receptive and passive woman character but being a dialectician who always has a question for Cruso, the master at the island, and Foe, the master of writing. She “elects to confess” her version of the island story, arbitrarily and by default, to Foe and again to patriarchy. She walks out of her ignominious life of erasure, absence and silence in Robinson Crusoe by standing up to Cruso at the island and Foe, the writer in the novella, back in England:

When I reflect on my story I seem to exist only as the one who longed to be gone: a being without substance, a ghost beside the true body of Cruso. Is that the fate of all storytellers? Yet I was as much a body as Cruso. I ate and drank, I woke and slept, I longed. The island was Cruso’s (yet by what right? By the law of islands? Is there such a
law?), but I lived there too ... Return to me the substance I have lost, Mr. Foe: that is my entreaty. (Foe, p. 51)

Susan portrays herself as binary to Cruso on the island. She as a “ghost” and an erased substantial body in Robinson Crusoe is compared with “the true body of Cruso” both in the writing and rewriting. Her erasure of the self in the classic text is visualized and termed as “ghost” presence in the retelling. She contradicts her earlier wish “to be gone” when she pleads the writer Foe to return her “the substance” which the canonical writing has denied to her. She only “seems to” be gone or a person without body but actually she is not. She is a living being who persists and resists patriarchal strategy to erase her being in the process of writing. Though she is challenging Cruso’s authority and presence, unconsciously she is defining herself in relation to him—“I was as much a body as Cruso.” She questions the epistemological basis of “all” male “storytellers” and their telling. She is skeptic of the patriarchal “law” (tradition) of writing where the island only belonged to Cruso and writing only documented his life and adventure when both Cruso and Susan “lived” there.

A woman in comparison with a man lacks her true representation in the present canonical writing. She becomes a “ghost” because of her absence as a writer of her own story. It is because of the difference between storytelling and story writing. The reason she loses her substance and becomes a “ghost” when Cruso retains his “true body” is directly related to Foe’s patriarchal and colonial bias shown in his writing. Though she is a “ghost” in the gaze of the hegemonic Other, she is a critiquing and arguing subject questioning the uncharted laws of colonialism, and seems to be regaining her voice. Spivak also points out the erasure of Crusoe’s wife from the classic text:

... the nameless wife who was married and died in the conditional mode in one sentence so that Crusoe could leave for the East Indies in the very year of the founding of the Bank of England. (1990, p. 7)

Spivak refers to the pertinent question about the identity of Crusoe’s “nameless wife.” The “one sentence” crosses out the identity of his wife whose death in necessary to justify Crusoe’s moving off the coast. She is presented redundant in the traditional plot. Her life prior to marriage, after marriage and till death gets no importance in the colonialist and patriarchal ambitious writing. We hardly know anything about her origin and the cause of her death. She has been passingly referred to in the classic text to jettison Crusoe of his familial obligations and matrimonial bondage. Like Susan, the “nameless” wife’s story also requires a fair
retelling to regain the voice and identity lost amid the structures of patriarchy and colonialism.

As a woman, Susan asserts her right of equity. Susan challenges the “law” which divides the human being along the line of the colonizer and the colonized. The same applies to the law of “writing” which accepts a colonizer and a man as “a true body” while denies “substance” to the body of a woman and a subject making them merely “ghost(s)” in the colonial/patriarchal writings. Brink (1998) observes that “woman as a presence (has been) largely excluded from official South African discourses; and history as canon” (p. 23). To look for Susan’s identical in other texts is a fruitful effort to understand her character but it is again structuralist approach which inherently bears the danger of identity fixation as David Block (2006) observes that structuralism looks to “establish universal laws of psychology or social structure to explain individuals’ fixed identities” (p. 34). Macaskill and Jeanne Colleran (1992) relate about Susan, a woman who is trying to write down her story:

As a result of what Hegel would call her “fight for recognition,” Susan at least seems to have overcome the phallocentric insistence on woman as bearer rather than maker of meaning. (p. 441)

Hegel interprets the process of recognition of an individual in relation to another. On the basis of “fight for recognition” in the realm of self-consciousness, the consequent relationship of the master and slave is defined where “the lord achieves his recognition through another consciousness (that is of slave)” (Hegel, 1998, p. 116) and not vice versa. The “phallocentric” approach makes a woman subservient to a man and in relation to Hegelian concept of “recognition,” she has not to be recognized as being “inferior” in the “fight for recognition.” So the master, Foe or Cruso theoretically has to make Susan as “bearer” of meaning rather than a “maker.” Macaskill and Jeanne Colleran have consciously avoided using a definite statement instead of a linking verb “seems” which, however, makes Susan’s bondage in the patriarchal and colonial structure relatively less intensive or slavish. She has momentarily overcome the “insistence” by not being accomplice to Foe’s fabricated stories. However, her “fight for recognition” does not win her equity or justice in the text, and she cannot “overcome” the patriarchal suppression and domination. The readers still await a story authored by her, taking on the “phallocentric” mode of signification. The “phallocentric” repression is based on Susan’s self-consciousness. She is the originator of information and source of knowledge for the writer Foe but her telling has been colonized by the patriarchal mode of writing which becomes an extension of “phallus”—male centric power:
That is part of the magic of words. Through the medium of words I have given Mr. Foe the particulars of you and Mr. Cruso and of my year on the island and the years you and Mr. Cruso spent there alone, as far as I can supply them; and all these particulars Mr. Foe is weaving into a story which will make us famous throughout the land, and rich too. *(Foe, p. 58)*

The “magic” or “medium” of (spoken and written) words becomes site of inclusion as well as exclusion of a being, consciousness or self. Susan gives partial meanings to “words.” They are not just spoken words. They include written too. Here, she means only spoken. Here, the expectation of being “famous” and “rich” is quite ironical as nothing such happens till the end of the story. In whatsoever faithful manner, Susan, being the sole witness to Friday’s part of life at Cruso’s island, might be revealing to the writer with adequate “supply” of “words.” However, she cannot contend the exclusions arising in the patriarchal and colonial writing mode till she is empowered by the skill of writing. To Susan’s disadvantage, she has no say in the medium of writing which is controlled and directed by patriarchy. Weaving, an art and handicraft traditionally associated with women, has been taken up by the writer Mr. Foe in case of story writing. It is matter of concern that, even in rewriting, Susan cannot weave her own story. She has to give the “particulars” of her experiences as a woman, mother and subject to Cruso and to Foe. The canonical story makes Friday “famous” for nothing else but an epitome of a faithful and willing slave, and both Susan and Friday as “us” are passive objects of the story.

Susan loses her “recognition” in the realm of being-written by Foe. She cannot uphold herself as “maker” of meaning in the colonialist and patriarchal mode of writing which becomes a source of her erasure. From the world of speech to the realm of writing, she is morphed into “bearer” of meaning from its “maker” in comparison with Friday who is from the world of silence and hence, remains an erasure both in the world of speech as well as writing.

Here, we find that *Robinson Crusoe* is part of the story prior to the arrival of Susan Barton who weaves only half of the story in fiction, and makes Robinson Crusoe famous contrary to the expectations of Susan Barton. As a privileged English writer and patriarch, Foe is not interested in Susan’s misfortunes or troubles. The traditional concept of “weaving” yarn by women has been utilized by patriarchy in writing to marginalize them. His bias is reflected in his weaving. The feminist and postcolonial challenge is to subvert “the West as culture of reference” *(Parry, 1998, p. 151)* by offering an alternative worldview. In this novel, Coetzee makes (Robinson) Cruso, (De)Foe and an English woman Susan as point/culture of reference.
even in rewriting. In comparison with the story of an English woman, Friday’s story, voice and identity remained minimalized and inaccessible. The rewriting may have been more subversive if the West could have been displaced as “culture of reference.” Susan may have been related to a marginalized ethnicity looking for her lost tribe or its members. She might have had access to the art of writing in the rewriting where she may have fulfilled the lost “substance” of herself at least, and, also, have traced the identity and voice of her lost daughter whose post-abduction story has lost its traces in the rewriting. Though an English woman, she has been a victim to the process of colonialism and slave trade. At this point, Susan has been partly successful in questioning the absence of women from the adventure story.

She dissociates herself from Friday in the following dialogue with Foe. Susan and Friday are no longer objects (“us”) of Foe’s gaze. She shows “partial presence” here unlike Friday. She differs as a “being” from Friday who is marked out as passive silence in the text, and defers the meaning of the word “silence” which is not always suppression; it can be intentional and empowering:

You err most tellingly in failing to distinguish between my silences and the silences of a being such as Friday ... What is the truth of Friday? You will respond: he is neither cannibal nor laundryman, these are mere names, they do not touch his essence, he is a substantial body, he is himself, Friday is Friday. But that is not so … what he is to the world is what I make of him. Therefore the silence of Friday is a helpless silence. He is the child of his silence, a child unborn, a child waiting to be born. (Foe, pp. 121-22)

The “silences” of Susan are in opposition to the “silences” of Friday. The cause of opposition and binarism between Susan and Friday is the presence and absence of voice. “Cannibal” and “laundryman” are not “mere names”—they fix Friday’s identity as the word “cannibal” stereotyped Friday’s identity in the classic text. Though he is a “substantial body,” as Susan claims in the narrative, however, his inner self and “essence” remains untouched and irretrievable in the rewriting. She tries to “make” something out of the part of Friday’s life she has been witness to, but she could not situate him in his unknown biography and cut-off history. In his “helpless silence”, Susan is also helpless to represent him and even her own self in writing. Susan contends that Friday cannot be defined by “mere names” or labels like “cannibal” or “laundryman” which are inconclusive to the “truth” of Friday. She particularizes Friday’s silence as “helpless silence.” The metaphors used for Friday “the child of his
silence,” “a child unborn,” “a child waiting to be born”— make Friday something abstract.

Friday, “the child of his silence,” “a child unborn,” and “a child waiting to be born” makes a comparison of the world of silence with the word of speech. As a child is nursed carefully in the womb of a mother in silence, and is delivered thumping into the world of speech so Friday has to be released from the silencing and oppressive womb of colonial world into the world of self-consciousness such that his voice might be audible and interpretable. The meanings of “silence” have been deferred in the text. Susan is in control of her speech unlike Friday who gets identity in the gaze of others. His identity cannot be explained in words. His “substantial” body is his identity, being and self. Except his “body,” he is silence incarnate. She, here, differentiates between “to represent” and “being represented.” But unlike the impression given in the text that she is at an advantageous point than Friday, her voice fails to convince Foe to write her true story, and she remains a bereaved mother unable to write her own story. In the absence of speech and inaccessibility to inner self, Friday becomes “a child unborn,” having no identity, voice, presentation and living prior to the development of self-consciousness in the world of speech and writing.

Susan Barton’s Story and Unresolved Case of a Missing Daughter

Susan tells “my story,” and owns her story. It is her story. She shares with the readers about her abducted daughter. The English patriarchy shows indifference towards her loss and does not offer any help. However, she resists the English officers by not letting go of her search venture. She tells the story of crew mutiny, and gives the reason of “hate for it”:

Two years ago my only daughter was abducted and conveyed to the New World by an Englishman, a factor and agent in the carrying trade. I followed in search of her. Arriving in Bahia, I was met with denials and, when I persisted, with rudeness and threats. The officers of the Crown afforded me no aid, saying it was a matter between the English. (Foe, p. 10)

The Englishman as an “agent in the carrying trade” or an “officer of the Crown” is the cause of injustice for the Englishwomen. Instead of being served with justice and “aid,” Susan faces “denials.” Here, patriarchy stands in opposition to the “abducted” daughter and the bereaved mother. The daughter has been erased, two years ago, by the “carrying
trade” and, now, the mother is being made to internalize silence and injustice. The “carrying trade” of Englishmen has deprived this Englishwoman of her daughter. Her tools of persistence, “rudeness and threats” to persuade “the officers of the Crown” could not convince the English Patriarchy that it was a matter of human concern. Here the phrase “between the English” is contradictory and political that has deprived a mother of her daughter.

In comparison with Cruso, the purpose of Susan’s voyage was retrieval of her abducted daughter instead of any slave trade. Susan is a marginal self in the story. To Spivak (1990), “marginal in the narrow sense is the victims of the best-known history of centralization” (p. 5). In rewriting, an attempt has been made to shift the focus of narration from the center to the margins. It also highlights that English families were also suffering from the slave trade. Susan Barton is a particular case in this text. Spivak (1990) shows her reservation on the rewriting Foe, “We could fault Coetzee for not letting a woman have free access to both authorship and motherhood” (p. 11). It is pertinent to note here that Coetzee’s text is more about the reasons behind the anxiety of authorship and influence than the ways to overpower them.

**Madwoman Looking for her Missed Mother: Susan Barton’s Double**

In the plot of searching mother and missing daughter, Foe interpolates the character of a fictional daughter having the same name as that of the mother. The imposter daughter named Susan is a binary to Susan, the mother. This stereotyped art of doubling and parallelism explains how the element of “probability” is used by the canonical writers to fictionalize the main plot of the story and create “doubt” about the authenticity, reliability and truth of the original story. Foe, knowing that Susan is searching for her lost daughter, sends to her a girl with the same name:

“My name is Susan Barton,” she whispered; by which I knew I was conversing with a madwoman ... “Your name is Susan Barton too” ... “I have followed you everywhere,” said the girl ... “Did you follow me across the ocean?” said I. “I know of the island,” said she. It was as if she had struck me in the face. “You know nothing of the island,” I retorted. “I know of Bahia too. I know you were scouring Bahia for me.” (Foe, pp. 73-74)

In this dialogue, two women have been subsumed under the same name “Susan Barton.” The girl as spokesperson of the writer Foe becomes
imposter for Susan’s lost daughter. Here, an unnamed girl has been used as an agent by patriarchy and in the place of an abducted girl against a bereaved mother. Here, a woman is used against a woman and becomes a binary to another woman. “My name” and “your name” are the same “Susan Barton” but claiming Susan’s name as hers, the girl displaces Susan Barton the mother from the center of her story. Her claim that she has followed the mother “everywhere” is fabrication of Susan Barton’s true story. The girl partakes of Susan’s adventure of the “island” and Foe tries to hijack Susan’s story right from “Bahia” through his ploy. The impersonate Susan is Foe’s accomplice.

Foe has interpolated a new character Susan Barton the girl as daughter and parallel to the mother, Susan Barton’s story. Susan Barton meets a girl who keeps standing outside her house staring constantly at the building. Susan Barton, the claimant daughter, is binary to Susan Barton the mother. She is a fictional character introduced by Foe, the writer, in the mother’s story of an abducted daughter. The real Susan Barton’s story is overshadowed by the story of doomed character Friday because of his speechlessness and lost origin, and displaced by Foe’s Susan Barton looking for her lost mother. Here is another untold story of a girl child. Susan finds a parcel in the ditch:

So I went on and unwrapped the body, stillborn or perhaps stifled, all bloody with the afterbirth, of a little girl, perfectly formed, her hands clenched up by her ears, her features peaceful, barely an hour or two in the world. Whose child was she? ... I must go back to where the child was hid before the crows got to her, the crows and the rats. (Foe, p. 105)

A little girl’s “bloody” body shows that she is an undesirable child, forsaken, discarded and thrown away. It is paradoxical that her “perfectly formed” body has been exposed but her story remains hidden. Susan unwraps “partially” what someone unknown has wrapped up. It is undecided in the text if the baby is “stillborn” or has been “stifled” for the unknown reasons. There is another missed story of a missed mother “whose child” was recovered by Susan. The “crows” and “rats” can scavenge its body and erase the evidence of its existence. Here crows and rats are binaries and comparable to the canonical writers who are equally threatening to the existence of othered characters in the story.

The story of the missing mother and still born child re-enacts Susan’s story and her taken away daughter in a patriarchal/colonial world of violence and injustice. She is determined to recover the child from the world of anonymity but it remains “hid(den)” in the text. The story a child
stillborn found by Susan goes missing further in the text. Like Friday, the “little” girl has lost her origin. As Friday is mute so is she “stifled” perhaps. In comparison with Friday, she is a stillborn who lost her voice prior to her birth. Though Friday is born and has a substantial body, he is also a “stillborn” in the world of speech and tongue. His body has not been delivered into the world of speech where existence and identity is preserved by using spoken or written words. The story of the baby girl is inaccessible and demands rewriting of her story to redeem her of the representational oblivion.

Conclusion

Friday’s indefinite silence, irretrievable voice and his self “waiting to be born” vis-a-vis Susan’s (conscious) loss of speech in view of patriarchy’s evident misrepresentation of her has limited the role and effectiveness of rewriting. Susan’s self-imposed silence and her selective or fractional representation by Foe can be interpreted as only “partial presence” to patriarchy, colonialists, the inner audience and the readers.

My study has established that “new text” which is rewriting here is a partial “correction” of silence and has set up itself against the authorized version of colonial and patriarchal oppression. Writing back to canon is not only prompting new writings and readings but also questioning them for having or furthering silences. The “responsibility” of the reader remains an abstract idea till his/her narrative leads to some substantial changes in the writing mode and the “world” it, subsequently, “interrogates” and constitutes. In this novel, Friday, the daughter and the girl child are without voices and mute and Susan fails to write a quite different story violating the writing protocols and standards set by the colonial and patriarchal representational mode upheld by Foe, the English author. Susan’s agency to write her own story remains stillborn in Foe and, hence, creates anxiety in the feminist writers with the challenge to deliver her true story to the readers.

Contextualizing Susan’s experience we can safely say that “the field of practice is a broken and uneven place” (Spivak, 1990, p. 20) which has marked many women like Susan and mutilated subjects like Friday as erasures in the Eurocentric history of colonial era. The meaning of silence, writing and authority has been questioned and deferred in the text. The incarnate silence has shown “embodied” presence in the text. The erasures and absences in the form of stereotypes and myths can be recuperated “partially” in history. Their faithful representation is always hard because of the “epistemic violence” of colonialism and the lack of substantial evidence erased and unrecorded by the machinery of colonialism and patriarchy. Her “partial” presence adds to the successes of
the feminist discourse which is to remain alert to the excesses of patriarchal and structuralist discourse. This “partial” re-righting of her character and self is somewhat corrective which needs to be acknowledged in order to explore more evidence lying in the deep sea of canonical writings by diving into the “wreck” caused by the history of colonial and patriarchal excesses.

Notes

1 I, henceforth, use the name Susan in my analysis instead of Susan Barton because Barton is her corrupted surname which inherits the danger of erasure of her independent identity and individuality under the weight of patronym.

2 This section has been, singularly, derived from Daniel Defoe’s Robinson Crusoe. I have only used page numbers without the text book name to avoid jarring repetition.

3 Bhabha (1994) explains the concept of “minimization” as a tool of resistance which can be used by the colonized to challenge the colonial derision by showing their “partial presence”:

Bhabha persuades that "colonial mimicry” is the desire for a reformed, recognizable Other, as a subject of difference that is almost the same, but not quite. (p. 86)

4 J.M. Coetzee has dropped ‘e’ of the name Crusoe and spelled it as C-R-U-S-O in Foe.

5 Though Spivak contextualizes the experience of women in her essay, “Can the Subaltern Speak?”, in case of the present rewriting, Friday is “deeply in shadow” in comparison with Susan:

It is, rather, that, both as object of colonialist historiography and as subject of insurgency, the ideological construction of gender keeps the male dominant. If, in the context of colonial production, the subaltern has no history and cannot speak, the subaltern as female is even more deeply in shadow. (1988, p. 287)
References


Critical Inquiry, 12(1), 243-261.


Punjabi Parents’ Perception of Punjabi as Their Children’s Mother Tongue

Aamir Shafi

Abstract

This study aims to explore the value which Punjabi parents attach to their mother tongue, especially with regard to its impact on their children. Two research questions related to the possible factors for indifference, namely Punjabi’s role in providing a reasonable job and educational standards reflected by the Punjabi language, were formulated. A convenient sample of 75 Punjabi parents was selected. Questionnaires, containing six independent and six dependent variables, were distributed among the participants. As the study explores the phenomenon of parents’ indifference, it may be regarded as exploratory and quantitative in nature. The results indicate that the parents do not consider Punjabi to be either economically beneficial or to have positive effect on education. A certain degree of linguistic insecurity is found among parents with regard to their mother tongue.

Keywords: mother tongue, indifference, linguistic insecurity

Introduction

Mother tongue gives an individual, as well as a group, his cultural identity. It is thus a common phenomenon world over that people communicate with their young ones in their mother tongue. The mother tongue is also a source of arousing feelings of loyalty with the group. To understand this concept we may imagine a situation when a person, living among speakers of a foreign language, hears his mother tongue and instantly becomes attentive to what is being said. This is because he experiences a sentimental bond with his mother tongue. UNESCO and other international organizations have also recognized the importance of mother tongue in the upbringing and development of a child.

Looking at the relative status of various major regional languages spoken in Pakistan, Punjabi comes across as the least popular among its native speakers. Jaffrelot (2002) observes that there is not a single Punjabi newspaper in Pakistan, and there is not a single school where Punjabi is taught.

Terdiman (1985) observes that language is closely associated with realities of power and selection of a language as medium of instruction can push others to periphery in terms of status and prestige. Shah (1997) points towards the irony of the situation in Punjab (see appendix 1) as he
reports that when a resolution was moved in 1990 to make Punjabi the official language, the ruling regime showed a lukewarm interest, but when not in office, it claimed to be the champion of the Punjabi’s cause. This indifference towards Punjabi is reflected in the policies as it is neither taught at the school level nor it is used as the official language in the province. In India the situation is relatively more favorable where Punjabi is one of the 22 languages with official status. One reason often stated for the better treatment of Punjabi language across the border is that it is closely associated with Sikhism. But this language very much existed even before the advent of the Sikh religion in the region. It is also a wrong but common perception that Punjabi can be written properly only in Gurmukhi script which is closely related with the Sikh religious scriptures. The fact is that the Muslims are orthographically independent who use Shahmukhi script for their writings. Like other modern languages, Punjabi is structurally complete. It can be adequately used for educational, official and social purposes.

Rahman (2002) argues that Punjabis have been collaborating with Mohajirs (Muslim immigrants from India in 1947) since partition to promote Urdu as a national language to block linguistic rights of other communities in order to snub further demands for rights by them. This may have contributed to the observable phenomenon that the Punjabi speakers tend to communicate with their children in Urdu, the national language, ignoring the usual role of a mother tongue. This attitude of a large group of inhabitants whose demography and power, according to Ahmed (2008), suggest that they are by no means a weak nationality or ethnic group, demand a closer study of the causes involved.

Punjabis use a typical word, paendo, for the person who wears orthodox villagers’ guise, shows crudeness of manners and speaks in the rustic Punjabi accent. This term springs connotations to cover any undesirable person. Thus one reason for avoiding Punjabi language may be the fear that one is ultimately labeled as paendo and, thus, consigned to social isolation.

Consequences

Preference of Punjabi parents to use a language other than their mother tongue with their children will probably result in the process of language shift which may result not in language death but in loss of Punjabi from Pakistani side of the Punjab. Punjabi should have the role of a dominant language because of its overwhelming presence in institutions. Ayres (2008) points out that Punjabis’ presence in army is as much as 80% and in federal bureaucracy 55%. Normally the shift results in the language of the minority linguistic group being replaced by that of the dominant
group; whereas, in Punjab this situation is reversed. It means that a major language has been replaced by the mother tongue of a small Urdu speaking community in the country.

Research Questions
The research questions framed are:
1. Whether or not proficiency in Punjabi language helps gain a reasonable job?
2. Whether or not the use of Punjabi language forms a favorable impression of the educational background of a person?

Objective of the Study
The study aims at:
1. Seeking answers with regard to causes of indifferent attitude of Punjabis towards their mother tongue;
2. Analyzing the causes of this attitude with a view to making explicit statements about them;
3. Suggesting steps which might bring improvement in the situation.

Literature Review
The attitude of the native Punjabis reflects a state of uneasiness that exists between Punjabis and Punjabi. Mansoor (1993) claimed that graduates of Lahore felt embarrassed to be called Punjabi speakers to the extent that they identified themselves as Urdu speakers. The literature review focuses on the circumstances which forced Punjabis to favor Urdu over their own mother tongue and to find the reasons for continuous neglect of Punjabi. Some relevant sociolinguistic concepts are also being stated.

Historical Perspective
Colonial Rulers’ Linguistic Policy in the Punjab

Even during the Sikh period, Ahmad (1990), as cited in Shahzad (2010), says that, the official language in Punjab remained Persian. But, he continues, that this does not mean that the Maharaja did not like his mother tongue. In fact, he patronized Punjabi poets and centers of Punjabi poetry flourished in every nook and corner of the province. Shahzad (2010) is of the view that the English rulers did not use Punjabi as medium of instruction as they knew that by doing so literacy rate in Punjab will increase. These educated people will come to know their rights and would challenge the rule of the invaders. Ramay (1985) also endorses this view and says that the English rulers decided to adopt Urdu as medium of instruction in order to curb Punjabi resistance.
A detailed and somewhat different account of “Urduization” in Punjab is found in Kamran (n.d.). He says that throughout Muslim rule, as well as during Sikh period, official business was conducted in Persian. This language was officially abandoned by British in India in 1836 and was replaced by English language. In Punjab, however, rulers soon found out that some local terms were almost untranslatable. Urdu was recommended in this regard which found favor with Government of India and thus Urdu became the official language of Punjab.

Kamran has also mentioned Woods Despatch, which has been called the “Magna Carta of English education in India.” According to it English would be used in elitist domains of power but the vernaculars will be used in the education of people. English officers supported Urdu for educational purposes in Punjab and gave Urdu the status of vernacular in Punjab, making it the only such region in the sub-continent. Later, government adopted a job policy which favored those candidates for jobs who were proficient in Urdu. Thus Punjabis found themselves in a situation where they had no choice but to get education in Urdu for the sake of economic benefits. There is a famous proverb in Punjabi language parhne pa ditta ay (we have been forced to learn) which shows Punjabis’ dislike for education. This dislike has its roots in the fact that they could not understand Urdu but were forced to get their education in that medium which was almost an alien for them.

**Linguistic Policies in Post-Partition Pakistan**

Soon after partition, Urdu was chosen as a national language of Pakistan which was a very significant political-linguistic decision. According to Ahmad (2002) the government claimed that Urdu possessed the potential to weld country’s different ethno-linguistic groups into one nation. The situation was, however, not so simple. One cannot hope to understand linguistic scene during the early period of Pakistan without having an idea about the political maneuverings. Meyer (1976), however, senses the controversy and says that in November 1947, without any debate in the parliament, Urdu was declared to be the national language of Pakistan, ignoring all the indigenous languages. Resultantly, as Ahmed (2004) states, Bengalis launched an anti-Urdu campaign which the government suppressed brutally. Thus the seeds of hatred were sown and the harvest was ready to be cut in 1971.

**Sociolinguistic Perspective**

**Language Attitude**

Trudgill (1992) has defined language attitudes as those attitudes, ranging from very favorable to extremely unfavorable, which people
formulate with regard to different languages, dialects, accents and their speakers and which may have strong impact on language behavior and on linguistic change. It is observed that Punjabis do not consider speakers of their native language decent. Rude, rustic and ignorant are some of the attributes given to the speakers of Punjabi by their fellow speakers.

**Linguistic Insecurity**

Trudgill (1992) defines linguistic insecurity as a set of language attitudes in which speakers come to have negative feelings about their native variety and feel insecure about its value. This insecurity may lead them to attempt to accommodate to or acquire higher status speech forms. Meyerhoff (2006) terms the scenario as linguistic insecurity where speakers are confused, feeling that the variety they use is somehow inferior, ugly or bad. The situation in Punjab is unique in the sense that prestige status has been granted to a non-regional language, Urdu, which is used for educational purposes and in offices; whereas, all the varieties of Punjabi have a dialectal or subordinate status. This indicates linguistic insecurity of Punjabis.

**Covert and Overt Prestige**

Meyerhoff (2006) says that sociolinguists recognize prestige as a complex value that speakers orient to in different ways. Trudgill (1992) is of the opinion that standard words, pronunciation and grammatical forms have overt prestige and bestow high social status to their users. The term covert prestige, according to Labov (1966), who introduced it, refers to favorable connotations which nonstandard forms have for many speakers.

Meyerhoff (2006) defines overt prestige as prestige associated with a variant that people are highly aware of and which can be associated with standard and moral evaluations like being nicer and better. The term covert prestige, he says, refers to the cases where speakers’ positive evaluation of a variant is genuinely hidden. About the phenomenon, Trudgill (1972) found that some speakers overtly talk about one variant as being better than another. These speakers claim to use the better form, but in fact do not. He suggested that this mismatch should be considered evidence of covert prestige. The researcher holds the view that Punjabi language enjoys covert prestige because apart from some formal situations Punjabi is used quite freely.

**Diglossia**

Hudson (1999) emphasizes that each individual linguistic item may have unique social distribution, but he also says that some societies have a simple arrangement, termed diglossia, in which at least one type of social restriction on items can be maintained over large-scale varieties and
not item by item. The term diglossia was introduced by Ferguson in 1959 in order to explain situation in Greece, the Arabic-speaking world, island of Haiti, etc. In all these societies, two distinct varieties are used, sufficiently distinct for lay people to call them separate languages. Of these varieties, one is used only on formal occasions and is normally called “High” (or H) or standard while the other is used by everybody under normal circumstances and is termed as “Low” (or L) or “vernacular.” Ferguson (1959) says that diglossia is a language situation involving primary dialects as well as a superposed variety of the same language in which latter is learnt formally and is used for written and formal spoken tasks.

Some writers have also used this term to cover situations which are not regarded diglossic according to this definition. Fishman (1971), for example, considers Paraguay as diglossic community, although the H and L, Spanish and Guarani, are totally unrelated.

Linguistic scene in Punjab may be described as diglossic in Fishman’s sense with Urdu being the H is unrelated to Punjabi which is the L variety. Another apparent difference between the situation here and those mentioned by Ferguson are that Urdu, the H variety, may not be learnt formally at school.

**Language Maintenance, Shift and Death**

According to Mesthrie and Leap (2004), language maintenance stands for the continuing use of a language in the face of competition from a regionally and socially more powerful language. The opposite of language maintenance, language shift, as described by Mesthrie and Leap, denotes replacement of one language by another as primary means of communication and socialization in a community. They further say that language death occurs if that community is the last one to use that language. Here a distinction has to be made between language death and loss. Language loss means that language shift has taken place in one of the communities speaking the language; whereas, in language death, the language is totally lost from the world.

In our scenario, if, at any stage, Punjabi language is replaced by another language, most likely with Urdu, it will be categorized as language loss and not death, since it is likely to remain in use in Indian Punjab.

**Methodology**

**Research Design**

Since the study explores the phenomenon of Punjabi parents preferring another language over their mother tongue and also that it deals with a practical situation, the research design of the study is
exploratory, applied and quantitative in nature. In order to obtain data, questionnaires were used as data collecting tools. The questionnaire (see appendix 2) was based on research questions and involved both dependent and independent variables.

**Population**

There was only one restriction on the selection of subjects for the purpose of research which was that the population was limited only to the Punjabi parents of school going children.

**Sample**

A convenient sample of 75 parents, fulfilling the population requirements, was selected. When time constraints and financial problems restrict researcher’s access to the entire population, he draws on what is available and the strategy, in the words of Gall et al. (1996), is referred to as convenient sampling.

**Data Collection Tool**

A self-administered questionnaire in English language was used to collect data. The questionnaire comprised of close-ended or fixed choice questions. It included a total of 12 questions which were divided into two parts. Questions 1-6, representing independent variables, were the profile questions about the parent, while the questions 7-12, representing dependent variables, were formulated to collect data with regard to research questions.

**Data Analysis**

The research method aimed to analyze factors which cause Punjabi parents to ignore their mother tongue. Data obtained from the parents were used to calculate frequency distribution; to gather information about skewness and kurtosis; and to find associations between independent and dependent variables representing the research questions. For this reason the statistical package for social sciences (SPSS) has been used.

Distribution includes set of data on a single attribute (variable). Many of the characteristics tend to distribute normally and the shape of the normal distribution is bell shaped. If we get a different shape then we have to give justification. Normal distribution is affected by two factors; skewness and kurtosis.

Each question on the questionnaire represents a variable. I shall attempt to analyze and interpret the distribution of dependent variables with regard to skewness and kurtosis. Each dependent variable is followed
by three choices; first choice indicates negative view; second indicates neutrality; third shows positive perception of the Punjabi parents towards Punjabi.

**Dependent Variable 1**

Table 1: Job Opportunity due to Punjabi

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>1.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard Deviation</td>
<td>.663</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1: Histogram of Dependent Variable 1

Since the value of mean is greater than those of median and mode, the data is positively skewed. The spread of the curve will be greater on the left hand side. Majority of parents consider that there is a little chance for a reasonable job for those who are more proficient in or have a higher degree in Punjabi. In other words Punjabi language does not guarantee lucrative jobs. As for kurtosis, the ratio between mean and standard deviation suggests that curve is nearly mesokurtic.

**Dependent Variable 2**

Table 2: Type of Job Punjabi might Provide

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>1.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard Deviation</td>
<td>.901</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The value of mean is greater than mode, although less than median, the data is slightly positively skewed which means that spread of the curve is on the left side. The parents favoring the 1st choice on the questionnaire are greater in number which means that in their view proficiency in Punjabi language is likely to make a person eligible for manual labor only. Since the ratio between mean and Standard deviation is about 2:1, graph can be described as platykurtic, indicating greater diversity.

**Dependent Variable 3**

Table 3: Chance to Get a Job Using Punjabi

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mean</strong></td>
<td>1.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Median</strong></td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mode</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Standard Deviation</strong></td>
<td>0.599</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3: Histogram of Dependent Variable 3
The value of mean is greater than those of median and mode, the data is positively skewed. This means that the spread of the curve is on the left side. Parents have favored the first choice more which indicates that in their view the use of Punjabi, during job interview, is not likely to earn a job. The ratio between mean and standard deviation indicates that curve is nearly mesokurtic which means that diversity is normal.

**Dependent Variable 4**

Table 4: Impression Punjabi Creates on Listeners

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>1.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>.778</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4: Histogram of Dependent Variable 4

Since the value of mean is greater than mode but less than median, the data is slightly positively skewed. The impression of majority of parents about Punjabi speakers is that they are not educated beyond intermediate level. Thus Punjabi language does not reflect that its users are highly educated. The ratio between mean and standard deviation indicates that the graph is close to being mesokurtic or normal one.

**Dependent Variable 5**

Table 5: Language Used by a Cultured Man

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>2.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>.448</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The values of mean, median and mode are almost identical. The data is normally distributed. In the view of majority of parents, a cultured man is likely to talk mostly in both Urdu and Punjabi. The ratio between mean and standard deviation indicates that the graph is leptokurtic indicating little diversity.

**Dependent Variable 6**

**Table 6: Poor Results due to Time Spent Outside**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>1.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mode</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard Deviation</td>
<td>.655</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean is greater than mode, although less than median, the graph is positively skewed. Majority of the parents consider that boys spend more time in mixing up with outsiders who normally speak Punjabi.
and this, in turn, affects their educational progress. Punjabi, according to parents, has negative impact on education. The ratio between mean and standard deviation shows that the graph, representing data, is nearly mesokurtic or normal.

To Find Associations between Variables

In order to find associations between various variables, different combinations of independent and dependent variables are used. There are six independent and six dependent variables in the questionnaire. It was decided to use one independent variable with any one out of the three different dependent variables related to the two research questions. This means that there will be a total of 12 combinations of independent and dependent variables. In order to avoid repetition, null hypothesis has not been stated. Since all the variables in the questionnaire represent nominal level of measurement, cross tabulation has been used to see the significance of association between them. The results have been obtained by using SPSS.

Nature of Job and Job Opportunity due to Punjabi (IV 1 and DV 1)

1) Problem Statement: Is there any association between nature of job and job opportunity due to Punjabi?

Table 7: Chi-Square Tests based on Cross Tabulation Results for Job Opportunity due to Punjabi and Nature of Job

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>4.549a</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>6.039</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 6 cells (50.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .84.
Figure 7: Bar Chart for Job Opportunity due to Punjabi and Nature of Job

2) Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between nature of job and Punjabi job opportunity (chi sq. = 4.55, sig. = .60). Null hypothesis claiming no significant association between the variables is, therefore, rejected.

3) Conclusion: Whatever the nature of job may be, parents seem convinced that Punjabi is not likely to provide job opportunities.

*Nature of Job and Talk of a Cultured Man (IV 1 and DV 5)*

1) Problem Statement: Is there any association between nature of job and talk of a cultured man?

Table 8: Chi-Square Tests based on Cross Tabulation Results for Talk of Cultured Man and Nature of Job

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>13.797a</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.032</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>16.194</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.161</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.689</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 8 cells (66.7%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .72.
Figure 8: Bar Chart for Talk of Cultured Man and Nature of Job

2) Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between nature of job and talk of cultured man (chi sq. =13.79, sig. = .03). Null hypothesis claiming no significant association between the variables is, therefore, rejected.

3) Conclusion: Parents expect that a Punjabi educated person will talk both in Urdu and Punjabi.

Parent Sex and Type of Job (IV 2 and DV 2)

1) Problem statement: Is there any association between parent sex and type of job?

Table 9: Chi-Square Tests Based on Cross Tabulation Results for Type of Job and Parent Sex

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>.774a</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.679</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>.777</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.678</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.763</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 0 cells (.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 6.07.
Figure 9: Bar Chart for Type of Job and Parent Sex

2. Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between parent sex and type of job (chi sq. = .77, sig. = .68). Null hypothesis claiming no significant association between parent sex and type of job is, therefore, rejected.

3. Conclusion: Parents of both sexes consider that those proficient in Punjabi are suitable for appointment as manual workers only.

**Parent Sex and Impression of Punjabi (IV 2 and DV 4)**

1) Problem statement: Is there any association between parent sex and impression of Punjabi?

Table 10: Chi-Square Tests Based on Cross Tabulation Results for Impression of Punjabi and Parent Sex

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>1.420(^a)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.492</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>1.435</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>1.371</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^a\) 0 cells (.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 7.93.
Figure 10: Bar Chart for Impression of Punjabi and Parent Sex

2. Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between parent sex and impression of Punjabi (chi sq. =1.42, sig. = .49). Null hypothesis claiming no significant association between parent sex and impression of Punjabi is, therefore, rejected.

3. Conclusion: Parents, especially housewives, do not consider Punjabi users to be highly educated.

**Parent Age and Chance to Get Job (IV 3 and DV 3)**

1) Problem statement: Is there any association between parent age and chance to get job?

**Table 11: Chi-Square Tests Based on Cross Tabulation Results for Chance to Get Job and Parent Age**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>8.111a</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>8.715</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.069</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Assoc.</td>
<td>.246</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 4 cells (44.4%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .59.
Figure 11: Bar Chart for Chance to Get Job and Parent Age

2) Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between parent age and type of job (chi sq. = 8.11, sig. = .1). Null hypothesis claiming no significant association between the variables is, therefore, rejected.

3) Conclusion: Parents, especially of mature age, are of the opinion that there are minimum chances that Punjabi can be used effectively to gain a job.

**Parent Age and Talk of a Cultured Man (IV 3 and DV 5)**

1) Problem statement: Is there any association between parent age and talk of a cultured man?

**Table 12: Chi-Square Tests Based on Cross Tabulation Results for Talk of Cultured Man and Parent Age**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>2.636a</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>3.816</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>1.623</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 6 cells (66.7%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .88.
Figure 12: Bar Chart for Talk of Cultured Man and Parent Age

2) Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between parent age and talk of a cultured man (chi sq. = 2.64, sig. = .62). Null hypothesis claiming no significant association between the variables is, therefore, rejected.

3) Conclusion: Parents of all age groups expect an educated Punjabi person to talk in both Urdu and Punjabi.

Parent Qualification and Job Opportunity Punjabi due to (IV 4 and DV 1)

1) Problem statement: Is there any association between parent qualification and job opportunity due to Punjabi?

Table 13: Chi-Square Tests Based on Cross Tabulation Results for Job Opportunity due to Punjabi and Parent Qualification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>7.853a</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>7.388</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.291</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.590</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 6 cells (50.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .84.
Figure 13: Bar Chart for Job Opportunity due to Punjabi and Parent Qualification

2) Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between parent qualification and job opportunities due to Punjabi (chi sq. = 7.85, sig. = .25). Null hypothesis claiming no significant association between the variables is, therefore, rejected.

3) Conclusion: Parents do not seem to trust the idea that there are much job opportunities for those educated in Punjabi.

Parent Qualification and Time Spent Outside (IV 4 and DV 6)

1) Problem statement: Is there any association between parent qualification and time spent outside?

Table 14: Chi-Square Tests based on Cross Tabulation Results for Time Spent Outside and Parent Qualification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>4.707a</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.582</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>5.584</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>.471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 6 cells (50.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .84.
Figure 14: Bar Chart for Time Spent Outside and Parent Qualification

2) Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between parent qualification and time spent outside (chi sq. = 4.70, sig. = .58). Null hypothesis claiming no significant association between the variables is, therefore, rejected.

3) Conclusion: Parents do not see Punjabi language as having much benefit for education.

**Monthly Child Fee and Chance to Get Job (IV 5 and DV 3)**

1) Problem statement: Is there any association between monthly child fee and chance to get job?

**Table 15: Chi-Square Tests Based on Cross Tabulation Results for Chance to Get Job and Monthly Child Fee**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>5.724a</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>5.653</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 4 cells (44.4%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .75.
Figure 15: Bar Chart for Chance to Get a Job and Monthly Child Fee

2. Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between monthly child fee and chance to get job (chi sq. = 5.72, sig. = .22). Null hypothesis claiming no association between monthly child fee and chance to get job is, therefore, rejected.

3. Conclusion: In the view of the parents, especially those belonging to middle class, there are minimum chances that Punjabi will help get a job.

**Monthly Child Fee and Time Spent Outside (IV 5 and DV 6)**

1) Problem statement: Is there any association between monthly child fee and time spent outside?

Table 16: Chi-Square Tests Based on Cross Tabulation Results for Time Spent Outside and Monthly Child Fee

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>1.450a</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.835</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>1.520</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.054</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.815</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 3 cells (33.3%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 1.31.
Figure 16: Bar Chart for Time Spent Outside and Monthly Child Fee

2. Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between monthly child fee and time spent outside (chi sq. = 1.45, sig. = .83). Null hypothesis claiming no significant association is, therefore, rejected.

3. Conclusion: Parents of all sections consider that Punjabi language does not help achieve good academic results.

Area of Residence and Type of Job (IV 6 and DV 2)

1) Problem statement: Is there any association between area of residence and type of job?

Table 17: Chi-Square Tests Based on Cross Tabulation Results for Type of Job and Area of Residence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>4.713a</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>4.821</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.792</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 1 cells (11.1%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 2.77.
2) Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between area of residence and type of job (chi sq. = 4.71, sig. = .32). Null hypothesis claiming no significant association between the variables is, therefore, rejected.

3) Conclusion: Parents, especially those residing in poor areas, believe that proficient Punjabi is likely to be appointed as only a manual worker.

**Area of Residence and Impression of Punjabi (IV 6 and DV 4)**

1) Problem Statement: Is there any association between area of residence and impression of Punjabi?

Table 18: Chi-Square Tests Based on Cross Tabulation Results for Impression of Punjabi and Area of Residence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>10.243a</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>12.239</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.282</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 1 cells (11.1%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 3.63.
2) Findings: Cross tabulation shows that there is significant association between area of residence and impression of Punjabi (chi sq. = 10.24, sig. = .03). Null hypothesis is, therefore, rejected.

3) Conclusion: Parents, especially those residing in poor and posh areas, do not seem to consider Punjabi speakers highly educated.

Discussion

Two research questions had been framed for the study. Later, six questions based on the research questions, three questions representing each research issue, were formulated and included in a questionnaire along with six profile questions. Thus there were six independent variables and six dependent variables in the questionnaire. The following results, based on the association of independent variables with the dependent variables, were found out.

Dependent Variables: Group 1 (Questions 1-3)

First three dependent variables in the questionnaire aimed to note the response of parents with regard to their perception of Punjabi as useful in gaining a reasonable job. The data obtained shows that parents do not consider proficiency in Punjabi to help in enhancing the chances to get a decent job. A majority of those asked considered that Punjabi can only help in being appointed as manual worker. Their low impression about their native language is reflected through their indicating that Punjabi diminishes chances of finding a job if used during an interview.
Dependent Variables: Group 2 (Questions 4-6)

Second set of three dependent variables were meant to study parents’ views with regard to the role of Punjabi in the education of their children. In general, parents’ opinion may be categorized as unfavorable towards Punjabi as far as education is concerned. They do not think that Punjabi reflects that its user is a highly educated person. They also believe that mixing up with the society, which generally speaks vernacular, produces adverse effects on the education of an individual. However, they take a lenient view with regard to the talk of a Punjabi cultured man, expecting him to mostly use both Urdu and Punjabi in his conversation.

The results indicate Punjabi parents have certain degree of linguistic insecurity with regard to their mother tongue. It must be mentioned that parents are only a section of the society. Different segments of society may have different views about the selection of a language for a specific domain. If a survey of students, especially in urban areas of Punjab, is conducted asking which language they use while talking to their friends, the results may indicate their preference for Urdu. In other words, the domains which were formerly regarded as informal might not remain so. Mesthrie and Leap (2004) are of the view that language shift involves progressive redistribution of the languages over formal and informal domains. Shifting community holds on to the informal domains with its native language for as long as it can. The process of shift is so slow that it requires studies spanning over a considerable time period in order to reach at concrete results which can be used to draw valid conclusions.

Conclusion/Recommendations

From the point of view of maintaining a groups’ identity and the importance of transfer of cultural values from one generation to the next, steps should be taken, first, for the survival and, consequently of, the growth of an endangered language, Punjabi in this case. Although English colonists are accused of giving Punjabis an artificial identity by making Urdu their vernacular, Punjabis themselves have also been instrumental in undermining their own language. Zaidi (2010) claims that abandoning of Punjabi language by the ruling elite has been detrimental to its spread at official, academic as well as societal levels. To achieve language maintenance in Punjab, two issues need to be addressed; low esteem in which Punjabis hold their language and lack of official patronage.

Changing Public Opinion

There have been movements to revive Punjabi language, but a large section of the society, it seems, has passive approach in this regard. One possible explanation, in this context, may be that the situation in
Punjab has assumed stability and people, in general, have come to accept social status and, consequently, domains of both Urdu and Punjabi. It is also argued that since Punjab has been frequently overrun by the invaders, people have lost pride required for the maintenance of their language. They are willing to accept any language which may bring them some advantage. In order to change Punjabis’ low view of their mother tongue, media and intellectuals can play an important role.

**Need for Official Patronage**

For the revival of the Punjabi language, government has an effective role to play. Government should seriously consider the undertaking of two important decisions. First, the provincial government should bestow official status to Punjabi. Second, Punjabi should be made a compulsory subject, at least, at the primary level.

**Punjabi as Official Language**

The bestowing of official status to Punjabi in the province should be followed by its selective use in government offices. At present, most of official business is carried out in English, and to some extent in Urdu; whereas, Punjabi has no role in this regard. Government may consider using Punjabi for specific tasks, for example, applications of various types; seeking job, requesting leave, giving explanation, etc. may only be accepted in Punjabi. This will require the officers, to whom the applications will be addressed, to acquire working knowledge of Punjabi. This will also demand people to gain proficiency in their mother tongue.

It has been observed from the results that parents do not consider Punjabi of much practical use, especially from the point of view of its use in offices. Such a decision, giving Punjabi a role in office work, would give a boost to the overall status of Punjabi. This means that Punjabi will have to be made a compulsory subject at school level in order to promote its proficient use later.

**Punjabi as Compulsory Subject**

Zaidi (2001) points at an interesting situation when he says that at present one can do an MA or PhD in Punjabi at university level but one cannot study it at school level even as an optional language. Perhaps, due to this treatment, most of the Punjabis are unable to read and write in their own language. Economic benefit is an important incentive for learning and using a language and this factor is missing in the case of Punjabi. Since Urdu and English are needed to undertake the official business, parents have; generally, unfavorable opinion towards Punjabi as far as education is concerned.
Even if the provincial government bestows official status to Punjabi, on the grounds that it represents the cultural values, the decision is not likely to find favor of a majority of parents for reasons mentioned above. Giving official status to Punjabi and its proposed use in offices can bring change in parents’ views about the importance of educating their offsprings in Punjabi language which will help bring it into the mainstream of education.
References


### Appendix 1

Lahore: Capital City of Punjab Province, Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Census Population</th>
<th>Urban</th>
<th>Rural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>91,379,615</td>
<td>45,978,451</td>
<td>45,401,164</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2

Profile Questionnaire

Name: __________________________ (Optional)

In the following questions, tick the choice which in your view is the most appropriate. Please do not leave any question unanswered.

1. Nature of job:
   a. government service   b. private service
   c. house wife           d. others

2. You are a:
   a. Male                 b. Female

3. Your age is:
   a. 30 or less           b. between 31 and 40   c. 41 or above

4. Your qualification is:
   a. matric or less       b. intermediate      c. graduation
   d. masters or above

5. Monthly fee of your child is:
   a. less than Rs.1000     b. between Rs.1000 and Rs. 5000   c. more than Rs. 5000

6. If Lahore is divided into following three broad divisions,
   A. Left of canal areas (Garden Town, Model Town, Cantt., Defence, etc.)
   B. Right of canal and left of Multan Road areas (Samanabad, Shadman, A. I.
      Town, etc.)
   C. Right of Multan Road and above The Mall areas (Bund Road, Sanda, Walled
      City, Misri Shah, Shadhara, etc.), where do you reside?
   a. A                      b. B                   c. C

7. If someone tells you that a time is about to come when Punjabi teachers will be
   in a great demand, you will:
   a. not trust that fellow          b. seek others’ opinion
   c. like your child to do masters in Punjabi

8. In your view a person, on the basis of his proficiency in Punjabi language, can be
   suitably appointed as:
   a. manual worker   b. clerk               c. executive

9. If a candidate uses Punjabi to explain some concept during job interview, his
   chances for getting an appointment letter are:
   a. minimal           b. sufficient       c. bright

10. If you are talking to a stranger on phone who is speaking in Punjabi language,
    your general impression about him will be that he is:
    a. illiterate        b. intermediate    c. graduate or above

11. If you meet a highly educated and cultured person whose mother tongue is
    Punjabi, you will expect him/her to be talking mostly in:

12. If you are to write an essay on causes of poor results shown by boys as
    compared to girls in board/university exams, will you mention the time spent by
    boys outside their homes as one of the causes?
    a. yes                b. may be          c. no
Etymological and String Analysis of Portuguese-Urdu Shared Vocabulary

María Isabel Maldonado García
Ana Borges

Abstract

The current study is framed within the discipline of applied linguistics and falls within the scope of contrastive analysis between Portuguese and Urdu. Portuguese and Urdu are Indo-European languages, hence, share a genetic relationship. In addition, they integrate elements from other languages such as Arabic and Persian. The originality of this study is based on the fact that until now, comparative studies of both languages are inexistent. In addition, both have integrated different elements belonging to other languages, such as Arabic and Persian. Lexical borrowing plays a fundamental role in this study considering the Portuguese presence in India for centuries. A comparative analysis of phonetically similar terms in Portuguese and Urdu is performed in order to confirm their common origin, and level of similarity in the form through an etymological and string analysis. This investigation is a very interesting and important didactic instrument for the Pakistani students of Portuguese language and the Portuguese speaking students of Urdu, who will learn how to identify shared vocabulary between these languages, and utilize this vocabulary for learning a second language. It is equally important for those interested in the studies of Portuguese and Urdu.

Keywords: shared vocabulary, linguistic similarities, bilingualism, historical linguistics

Introduction

The purpose of this research is to analyze 10 sets of terms which present phonetic similarities in Portuguese and Urdu languages. The rationale behind the comparison is to assist language students in the identification of shared vocabulary. In this case, it will be revealed whether the pairs have a common origin or not and possess other elements of similarity, such as semantics. The words from Portuguese language are balde, braço, chá, chave, dez, girafa, hospital, sono, toalha, tu.

As we move forward within the study, we should mention briefly the history of comparative linguistics. This is a branch of historical linguistics that deals precisely with the comparison between languages and thus establishes among them historical relations, for example their genetic
relationships. The studies of the common origin of languages date back to the eighteenth century, with William Jones, (1746-1794), British orientalist and jurist who worked with Indo-European languages and launched the hypothesis that among them there was a common origin. He was not only a linguist; he was a self-taught polyglot. In fact, he conducted research highlighting a number of similarities between Sanskrit, and Greek including a common origin (Olchewski, 2002). Many others followed such as Johang Christoff Adelung, of whom it is said that he contributed to linguistics creating the term “Indo-European,” as well as Franz Bopp who was another German linguist, known for his extensive work within the frame of Indo-European comparativism. It was him, though; the one to propose through a detailed comparison to show that within the Indo-European languages there was a common origin.

Languages which are related, belong to the same family and one original language denominated in linguistics i.e., proto-language. According to Robert Rankin:

While the principal goal of most linguists who are also historians has been to learn as much as possible about earlier languages and about past cultures through their languages, other branches of linguistics have benefited a great deal from the by-products of comparative work. Many who are philosophically synchronic linguists have looked to comparativists to inform them about the possible types and trajectories of language change. The study of attested and posited/reconstructed sound changes has played an important role in the formulation of notions of naturalness in phonological theory, and modern theories of markedness and optimality often rely, implicitly if not explicitly, on historical and comparative work. (2003)

According to Countinho (1976), “The Comparative-Historical method is based on relating the facts of a language similar to another in the same family so they discover the source or origin.” In this context it is possible to reconstruct a proto-language through the similar characteristics of derived languages.

Portuguese language has been influenced by several other languages such as Persian and Arabic. The number of Arabisms found in Portuguese language is considerably less than in Spanish language. In addition, contact between Portugal and Persia began in the late fourteen hundreds and due to this reason Portuguese language has been influenced by Persian language.
The Portuguese at that time in history began their maritime expansion, spreading to many regions of Africa, Asia and America. From the sixteenth to the eighteen century, Portuguese language became the Lingua Franca of Asia and Africa being it used for the administration of the colonies or for trade and communication among the local officials.

In the early twentieth century, the political presence of Portugal in Asia was limited to the territories of Goa, Daman and Diu, in India; a part of the island of Timor, Indonesia; and the area of Macau, on the shores of China. But the Portuguese had controlled much more extensive regions formerly, especially in Ceylon and Malacca. Today, the Portuguese sovereignty disappeared in the East: Macau definitely went to China in 1999, the "Portuguese India" was recovered by the Indian Union in 1961; Timor was annexed by Indonesia in 1974. Still Portuguese is still present in some of these areas. In the state of Goa, in India, the Portuguese language is currently taught in official and private schools. The Goa University has a Master's Degree in Portuguese Studies since 1988. It is also an official language of the "Special Chinese Administrative Region" Macau (alongside Chinese). It is not strange though, that Urdu, originally an Indian language has been influenced by Portuguese.

Figure: Genetic Relationship between Portuguese and Urdu Languages

---

1. Figure: Genetic Relationship between Portuguese and Urdu Languages
The figure illustrates genetic relationship between Portuguese, a Romance language and Urdu, an Indic language.

It is assumed, given the previous information, that during this research some percentage of borrowing as well as phonetic adaptation to the new language will be encountered. Campbell states “there are many different kinds of language-contact situation, and the outcome of borrowing can vary according to the length and intensity of the contact, the kind of interaction, and the degree of bilingualism in the populations” (1998). Haspelmath & Tadmor on the other hand state that when assessing genealogical relatedness it is fundamental to separate or identify inherited material from that material that constitutes a borrowing. While the loan words are an indication of historical contact, they are not of genealogical relatedness (2009, p. 1).

The motivation of our research is to embark in comparative linguistic research involving Urdu and Portuguese. Urdu is a language which has not been investigated thoroughly from a linguistics point of view. The Urdu departments of the Pakistani Universities focus on the study of Urdu literature rather than Urdu linguistics. Rahman, a well-known Pakistani linguist stated “Pakistan is perhaps the most backward country of South Asia in the field of linguistics” (1998). Fifteen years later, the situation has considerably improved, yet, the above statement still holds true.

When carrying this research we should not fail to mention the previous research of Maria I. Maldonado titled Estudio Etimológico de Cuatro Pares de Cognados en Español y Urdu, published in 2013 in the journal Revista Iberoamericana de Lingüística, Vol 8. In her work, Maldonado’s hypothesized that since Arabic and Persian are languages which have influenced Spanish and Urdu, there must have been a common origin in some of the sets. The end result of the etymological study was a common origin in at least two sets of the analyzed vocabulary which had their origin in Arabic and Persian and in the other two sets there was some level of uncertainty, although the evidence pointed to a common origin in both, one Latin and the other Germanic.

According to Maldonado, “En el ámbito de este trabajo, los cognados son en realidad, sinónimos en lenguas diferentes; distintos significantes que representan el mismo significado” (2013). This means that in line with the author, cognates are synonyms in different languages, different signifiers with the same meaning. This definition was obtained from Curso de Gramática Española written by the renowned Spanish linguist Francisco Marcos Marín (1980). The previous research produced positive results, for that reason in the present research the same
procedure will be followed in order to identify the origins, semantic and phonetic similarities present in the ten sets of cognates, so that students can utilize the procedures for cognate identification.

**Methodology**

The sample object of our investigation consists of ten term sets of Portuguese and Urdu. The words were selected due to their synonymy as well as their apparent phonetic similarity. This is only a sample set as multiple other cognates have already been identified. The degree of similarity with reference to different aspects of linguistics will be assessed. These aspects are:

1. **Etymological Aspects**
   The etymology of each word in Portuguese language will be extracted and compared with its counterpart in Urdu language in order to contrast the origins of both terms.

2. **Interlingual Synonymy Related Aspects**
   - **Semantic Analysis:** Definitions will be compared in order to find out if the shared vocabulary is synonymic or not.
   - **Phonetic Analysis:** The phonetics of the word pairs will be compared according to the following parameters:
     a. There is no difference in phonetics.
     b. The difference is of one or two sounds, usually at the end.
     c. The difference is found in two or more different sounds, sometimes at the initial position.
     d. The difference is more than half of sounds.
     e. The difference is based on the fact that most of the sounds are different and have an uneven layout.
     f. The Levenshtein distance will also be used as a factor to determine the level of phonetic similarity.

Once the information has been extracted, a contrastive analysis of these results will be conducted.
Data Presentation

The data is presented in the form of tables. First, the sets of Urdu-Portuguese words are presented. Then their etymology, semantic and phonetic similarity is traced and presented in the form of tables.

Table I: Urdu-Portuguese Sets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sets</th>
<th>Portuguese</th>
<th>English Meaning</th>
<th>Urdu &amp; Latin Script</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Set 1</td>
<td>balde</td>
<td>bucket</td>
<td>balti (بالتی)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Set 2</td>
<td>braço</td>
<td>arm</td>
<td>bazoo (بنازو)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Set 3</td>
<td>chá</td>
<td>tea</td>
<td>chai (چائے)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Set 4</td>
<td>chave</td>
<td>key</td>
<td>chabi (چابی)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Set 5</td>
<td>dez</td>
<td>ten</td>
<td>daz (نس)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Set 6</td>
<td>girafa</td>
<td>giraffe</td>
<td>zarafa (زرافا)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Set 7</td>
<td>hospital</td>
<td>hospital</td>
<td>aspatal (اسپتال)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Set 8</td>
<td>toalha</td>
<td>towel</td>
<td>tolia (تولی)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Set 9</td>
<td>sono</td>
<td>sleep</td>
<td>sona (سونا)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Set 10</td>
<td>tu</td>
<td>you</td>
<td>tu (تو)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Etymological Aspects

Table 2: Etymology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Portuguese</th>
<th>Urdu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1.Signifier: balde | Signifier: بالتی Phonetics: ['bal.te.e']  
Word of uncertain origin.  
Originally derived from the Portuguese word balde. |
| 2.Signifier: braço | Signifier: بنازو Phonetics: ['ba.zoo']  
From the Latin bracchium, -ii and this one from the Greek brakhion.  
Originally a Persian word and this one from Old Avestan baazu, baazaau. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sign 1: Portuguese</th>
<th>Common Meaning</th>
<th>Sign 2: Urdu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Signifier: <strong>balde</strong>&lt;br&gt;Phonetics: ['bal,de]</td>
<td>An oval or cylindrical open container, made of metal or plastic used to hold and carry liquids.</td>
<td>Signifier: ہالڑی&lt;br&gt;Phonetics: ['bal,te.e]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Inter-Lingual Synonymy Related Aspects**

Table 3: Semantics and Form

<p>| Signifier: <strong>chá</strong>&lt;br&gt;From Mandarin <strong>ch’a</strong>. | Signifier: چا&lt;br&gt;Phonetics: [tʃa.'e.e] | From Chinese Language. |
| 4. Signifier: <strong>chave</strong>&lt;br&gt;From Latin <strong>clavis</strong>, -e. | Signifier: چاپ&lt;br&gt;Phonetics: [tʃa.'e.e] | Portuguese word derived from the original. |
| 5. Signifier: <strong>dez</strong>&lt;br&gt;From the Latin <strong>decem</strong>. | Signifier: ڈے&lt;br&gt;Phonetics: ['dz] | In Urdu, the word arrived through Prakrit. |
| 8. Signifier: <strong>toalha</strong>&lt;br&gt;From Provencal <strong>toalha</strong>, and this one from Frankish (a Germanic language) <strong>thwahlja</strong>. | Signifier: تُولِیاء&lt;br&gt;Phonetics: [t̪o.'le.a] | The author is unsure. Probably from English. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signifier</th>
<th>Phonetic</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4. Signifier: chave</td>
<td>[ʃaˈb]</td>
<td>Key. A small piece of shaped metal with individual shapes used to open or close a lock.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Signifier: dez</td>
<td>['deʃ]</td>
<td>Ten. Number. Equivalent to the product of five and two; one more than nine; 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Signifier: hospital</td>
<td>[ɔʃ.pi.ˈtəl]</td>
<td>Hospital. Medical and surgical institution providing care for the ill or injured.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Signifier: toalha</td>
<td>[tu.ˈa.lea]</td>
<td>Towel. Absorbent cloth or paper used for drying oneself or things, usually of rectangular shape.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Signifier: sono</td>
<td>['so.ˈno]</td>
<td>Sleep. A condition of body and mind which usually recurs for a few hours every night. The nervous system presents inactivity, suspension of consciousness and body rests during this state.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Analysis of the Results

Identification of the Sets

The identification of the ten sets of shared vocabulary between Portuguese and Urdu was performed during our interaction with Pakistani individuals as well as Pakistani and Portuguese speaking students at University of the Punjab. Ten pairs of terms were selected which presented similarity in relation to semantics and phonetics. Basic terms have been included in the list, such as low cardinal numbers, body parts, etc., since there is a higher probability of these terms being inherited from a proto-language, hence being identified as a cognate.

Etymological Aspects

SET 1: Balde – ہالٹے ['baŀte.e]

Balde in Portuguese has an uncertain origin. In Urdu, the word بالٹے was taken from Portuguese. The first record of it in the written form dates to 1900. The particular book was Mirza Rusva’s Sharif Zada. The novel is about a man who turns entrepreneur through a happy and content life with new social values. According to the findings it is a borrowed term from Portuguese language.

SET 2: Braço – ہاژو ['ba.zoo]

Braço in Portuguese has come from the Latin bracchium, -ii and this one from the Greek braklion, upper arm (which is from the Indo-European bhaaghu). On the other hand, باژو is originally a Persian word, from Old Avestan baaazu, baazaaau. The Sanskrit cognate is baahu. It was used for the first time in 1503 in the book Nausar Har written by Shah Ashraf Bayani. The book is a long epic describing the martyrdom of the prophet of Islam’s grandson (2006, p. 169).

SET 3: Chá – چائے ['tʃə.e.e]

The set shares a common Chinese origin. In Portuguese language it came from the Mandarin ch’a (Amoy dialect). The first report of the word we have is from the 1550s when the term arrived through Macao. In Urdu the term چائے was first recorded in the book Lecturaun Ka Majmua by the author Muhammad Nazeer Ahmad Khan in 1892. The pair shares the same origin since they both borrowed the term from Chinese language. Other cognates which came from Mandarin are Arabic: shay, Greek: tsai, Persian: cha, Russian: chai, Turkish: çay.

SET 4: Chave – چابے ['tʃə.βæ.e.e]

In Portuguese the term chave comes from the Latin clavis-e 'door-key, bar.' In Greek, the oldest form we can reconstruct is klau-; assuming this to be the oldest form in Italic it is explainable why Latin had a stem (clavis) as
well as an ostem (clavus). Other cognates from Indo European are: Myc. ka-ra-wi-po-ro /Kλαφ-φόρος/, PGr. klāui- with base on the noun klāu(o).

In Urdu the word ğâbi has been borrowed from the original Portuguese term and underwent an adaptation. In this language its presence was reported for the first time in 1869 in the book Khutut-i-Ghalib by Mirza Asadullah Khan Ghalib. The pair shares the same origin.

**SET 5: Dez – دس ['daz]**

The set shares apparently a different origin. In Portuguese, the term is derived from the Latin *decem* or *decern*. In Urdu, the word arrived from Prakrit which is the vernacular form of Sanskrit. The Indo-European root is shared by Sanskrit *daśa*, Greek *deka*, and Latin *decem*. It is for this reason that the set shares a common origin. Other cognates are from Proto Indo-European (Germanic): *dekm*, Albanian: *djetu*, Armenian: *tasn*, Avestan: *dasa*, Breton: *dek*, Greek: *deka*, Lithuanian: *desimt*, Old Church Slavonic: *deseti*, Old Irish: *deich*, Sanskrit: *dasa*, Welsh: *deg*.

Arabic language also used it in the same way as Prakrit during the time of the prophet of Islam. The first record of the word in Urdu is dated to 1635 in the book called *Sabras* which is the first book written in Urdu language recorded in history. It was written by Asadullah Wajhi. It was actually a translation from a Persian book *Masnavi Dastur-e-Ushshaq and Husn-o-dil* written by the Persian author Mohammad Yahya Ibn-e-Saibak. The printing press had not yet arrived in India so the book was handwritten. Interestingly enough, the first printing press was brought to India by the Portuguese and the first Urdu book printed was published in 1801. Its title was *Bagh-o-Bahar* and the author was Mir Amman.

**SET 6: Girafa – زرافه [z̧-a.‘ra.fa]**

The set is an interesting one. In Portuguese *girafa* came from Arabic *zarafa*, "girafa," through the Italian *giraffa*. The term is derived from an Arabic word although the letter *g* which comes from a derivation of the letter *z* is not a natural phenomenon. We can assume that the word is a common combination or linguistic metathesis. The scientific name of giraffe is *Giraffa camelopardalis*, family *Giraffidae*.

In Urdu the word was borrowed from the English *giraffe* and used for the first time in 1895 in the book *ilm al-lisan*. Although the Urdu dictionary does not reflect the complete etymology, the word entered English language in the late 16th century from the French *giraffe*, the Italian *giraffa* or perhaps the Spanish or Portuguese *girafa* with origin in the Arabic *zarāfā*. In Middle English it was called camelpard. The pair shares the same origin.
SET 7: Hospital [ass.|pa.'tal]

The set shares a common origin. In Portuguese language it is derived from the Latin hospitalis [domus], guest house. Italic cognates include Pael. hospus [nom.sg.] 'stranger' (-pot-ij)s; Indo European Cognates: OCS gospodb; Russian gospod' the Lord, god' ghost(i)-pot- (Slav, -d- from the voc.sg. -pofi).

In Urdu the word is taken from the English hospital. It was considered slang until it was used in writing for the very first time in 1869 in the book Khutut-i-Ghalib by Mirza Asadullah Khan Ghalib. In English language it came into Middle English via Old French from Medieval Latin hospitales neuter of Latin hospitalis.

SET 8: Toalha – تولِیا [to.'le.a]

The set has apparently different origins. In Portuguese it came from Provencal toilha, which is from Frankish, a Germanic language, thwahlja. The author of the Urdu dictionary is uncertain about the origin and mentions English as a possibility. English is a Germanic language; hence this presumption could be correct and the set could share a common origin. In fact, if it came from the English towel, it would have arrived in Middle English from (towel, towail, towaille) Old French toaille, from the Frankish thwahlja, from Proto-Germanic thwakhlijon, and from Proto Indo European tʰax-. Some cognates are the Old High German dwahila, the Modern German Zwehle, the Dutch dwaal "cloth used for the altar," Middle Dutch dwale, in Old English þwean "to wash."

SET 9: Tu – تو ['to.o]

The set shares a different origin. In Portuguese it stems from the Latin Tu, "tu" which in turn comes from the Proto Indo-European tu "you" (nom. sg.). Some Proto Indo-European cognates are ti (H) [nom.], tue [acc.], toi [gen.dat.], teue [gen.], tued [abl.] 'you,' tu-o- 'your.' Indo European cognates: Hit. zik [nom.], tu- [obi.], CLuw. ti, tu- tiH, tu"; Sanskrit. t(u) Vam [nom.], t(U)vam [acc.], tubhya(m) [dat.], t(u)vdt [abl.], tdva [gen.], tv, tuva [acc.encl.], te [gen.abl.dat.encl.]

In Urdu the term is derived from Sanskrit tao. Because of influence of Persian and Sanskrit, it is possible that the word tao became tu. It was used for the first time in 1739 in the book Qulyat-e-Siraj by the Urdu poet Siraj Aurangabadi.

SET 10: Sono – سونا [sona]

In Portuguese the term sono is derived from the Latin somnus, -i. Some Proto Indo-European cognates are swep-no, from the root swep- "sleep."
in Sanskrit svapnah, in Avestan kvafna-, in Greek hypnos, in Lithuanian sapnas, Latin sopor "deep sleep," and Old English swefn.

Indo-European cognates are OIr. suan, W. hun 'sleep' suopno; Hit. supp-('f)ri 'to sleep' sup-(t)o, suppariie/a'to sleep' sup-r-ie/o supparuant-/sleepy. In Sanskrit svapna- [m.] 'sleep, dream,' svapnya- [n.] 'dream, vision,' dusvapnyam nightmare,' Av. xvafna- [m.] 'sleep, dream.' The Latin somnium may derive from Proto Indo-European derivative (already suggested by Schindler) or perhaps be a formation of inner-Latin. There is a chance that the Proto Indo-European suepno- is probably a derivation of the r/n-stem suep-r/n-.

In Urdu the word سو‫ن‬ا came from the Prakrit shu. It is used as a noun with so. The term was used for the first time in 1503 in the book Nausar Har from the author Shah Ashraf Bayani.

Semantic Analysis
The pairs present shared meanings in all sets, although this is not true for all definitions, rather, in at least one of the definitions, while other meanings are not shared.

Analysis of the form
The form, in which Portuguese and Urdu is written, without any doubt, is completely different. While Spanish utilizes Latin script, Urdu utilizes Arabic-Persian script, Nastaliq style. For this reason the pairs do not share any orthographic characteristics. The form will be analyzed through the phonetics of both languages.

SET 1: Balde ['bal.d] بائٹے – ['bal.te.e]
Level of phonetic similarity: 3/6 -bal-
'b-a-l̪-d̪ ≠ 'b-a-l̪-e-e'
The difference in the form is of more than two different sounds at the end. The common sounds [b][a] [l] constitute the similarity level which is of 50%.
Levenshtein distance: 3

SET 2: Braço ['bra.zo] ب١ازو – ['ba.zoo]
Level of phonetic similarity: 4/6 b-azo-
b-r-a.-z-o ≠ b-a-z-o-o
There is a phonetic difference of two sounds [r] and the last [o] of the second term. The common sounds are [b][a][z][o]. The level of similarity is of 66.66%
Levenshtein distance: 2

SET 3: Chave [ja'b] – چاھے [tʃa.'e]
Level of phonetic similarity: 1/4 -a-
\[a-b \neq tʃ-a-\varepsilon\]

The difference is present in more than two sounds. Nevertheless, as in the previous case similarity is found in sounds that are different. In the pair [ʃ] versus [tʃ] like in the previous case and in [b] versus [β̞], similarities can be found, since the sounds are somehow identifiable with each other and there is correspondence between them.

The difference is based then on the fact that one sound [a] is identical while [ʃ] and [tʃ] are correspondent and in the same location within the word and [b] and [β̞] also share the same relationship and are located in the same place within the word. The last vowel in the Urdu word is not present in the Portuguese word. Hence, the common sound [a] constitutes the level of similarity which is of 66.6%.

Levenshtein distance: 2

SET 4: Chá [ja'ʃ] – چاے [tʃa.'e]
Level of phonetic similarity: 1/3 -a-
\[a ≠ tʃ-a-\varepsilon\]

Initially, the difference is based on the sound [ʃ] versus [tʃ] as well as an ending [e] sound. The common sound is [a]. Similarity can also be found on the fact that between [ʃ] and [tʃ] there is correspondence.

The common sound [a] constitutes the level of similarity which is of 66.6%.

Levenshtein distance: 1

SET 5: Dez ['dэʃ] – دس ['daz]
Level of phonetic similarity: 1/3
\[d-e-ʃ ≠ d-a-z\]

The difference in the form is obvious in the second and third sounds with \(e-ʃ \neq a-z\). The variation is found in the second and third sounds. The common sound is [d] although it is followed by a vowel and there is correspondence in the similar sounds \(ʃ/z\) which will not be counted in the percentage. The similarity level is of 33.3%.

Levenshtein distance: 2

SET 6: Girafa [dʒi.ɾa'.fa] – زرافه [z-a.'ra.fa]
Level of phonetic similarity: 4/6

81
The similarity is based on the last four sounds which are identical [r][a][f][a].
The level of similarity is of 66.66%

**Levenshtein distance: 2**

SET 7: Hospital [oʃ.pi.'tal] – اسپیتال [as.pa.'tal]
Level of phonetic similarity: 4/7
oʃ-p-i-t-a-l ≠ a-s-p-a-t-a-l
The similarity is based on the third sound [p] as well as the last three sounds [t][a][l].
The level of similarity is of 57.14%.

**Levenshtein distance: 3**

SET 8: Toalha [tu.'lea] – ﺖواليا [to.'le.a]
Level of phonetic similarity: 4/7
٣-٦-١-٥-٦ ≠ ٣-٠-٥-٦-٦
The difference is based on more than two different sounds in the center of the word.
The sounds [t] [l][e] [a] constitute the level of similarity which is of 57.14%.

**Levenshtein distance: 2**

SET 9: Tu [to.o] – ﺕو [ˈto.o]
Level of phonetic similarity: 3/3
ْ-٠-٥ = ْ-٠-٥
The sounds of this word are identical. The level of similarity is 100%.

**Levenshtein distance: 0**

SET 10: Sono ['so'.no] – سوينا ['so.na]
Level of phonetic similarity: 3/4
ٴ-٠-٥ ≠ ٴ-٠-٥
The difference is based on one different sound at the end of the word. The sounds [s] [o] [n] constitute the level of similarity which is of 75%.

**Levenshtein distance: 1**

82
Discussion

In two of the sets, the Urdu term has been borrowed from Portuguese language and in one of them the origin of the Portuguese term is inconclusive. Four of the sets share the same origin and there is a high level of probability that one more shares the same origin making it obvious that these sets have been borrowed. Three of the sets have a different origin. In one of the sets the Urdu dictionary only cites the vehicular language, rather than the origin, although it can be traced to a Sanskrit root. A more exhaustive investigation of the etymon of the unclear terms is necessary, possibly revealing a common origin in some of the sets. In Portuguese language, the origins of the terms have been contrasted in different dictionaries, resulting in the same origins in all of the different sources. In Urdu, the absence of diverse sources makes it impossible to conduct a deeper contrastive analysis. For this reason, we believe that in addition to the creation of additional sources in Urdu, a review of the terms in the Urdu dictionary would assist etymological study of the Urdu lexicon.

The study is of interest to the Pakistani students of Portuguese as well as the Portuguese speaking students of Urdu as it can help in the phonetic and semantic recognition of shared vocabulary and in understanding language borrowing as well as how these languages are related and interact with each other. It is also an important study from the point of view that it opens doors for facilitating language acquisition through the recognition of cognates and shared vocabulary.

The study is also of interest to linguists working in comparative linguistics and genetic studies of Indo-European languages as until now studies comparing both languages, Portuguese and Urdu have never been performed.
References


Copyright Statement

Copyright © 2013, the authors assign to NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry and National University of Modern Languages a non-exclusive license to use this document for publication, personal use and in courses of instruction. The author also grants a non-exclusive license to NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry to use this document in worldwide publication, distribution and reprint in all languages, forms and media. Any other usage is prohibited without the express permission of the author.
Disclaimer

While every effort has been made to authenticate material submitted by research scholars, the National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad, is not responsible for the content of papers accepted for publication in the NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry.
CALL FOR PAPERS

The NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry delineates borders in specialization through increasingly focused research to reach for newer insights and achieve feats of understanding. It also motivates human capacity to connect with one another through active engagement in and exploration of issues and challenges ahead in jaded and didactic research practices. It brings in freshness and freedom which culminates into self discovery and profound realization of innovative pedagogical investigation. It encourages perception which is responsive, well informed, and cognizant and fosters ability to question established beliefs and conventions.

The NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry (ISBN 2222-5706) provides platform for researchers, classroom practitioners and academic professionals to share their novel theoretical and practical research initiatives in the areas of Language, Literature, Applied Linguistics and Education. Being multidisciplinary in nature, the NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry hosts stimulating, inspiring and informative research papers catering to the complex and increasingly diversifying multidimensional needs of learners, teachers and professionals in diverse contexts. Contributions that bring forward new ideas in pedagogy and creative thinking, generating new knowledge(s) through reasoning and research are welcome. The journal also accepts Book Reviews in related multidisciplinary areas.

As per NUML JCI Publishing policies, papers that have been in conference proceedings or have been published elsewhere are not accepted. In case a paper is based on a dissertation, the contributor must provide all the relevant details against which the submission maybe validated.

We are receiving contributions for forthcoming issue now.

For more information please contact:

Dr. Farheen Ahmed Hashmi
Editor, NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry
Email: numl.editor@gmail.com
ORDER FORM

- Please accept my subscription for ................. year(s).
- Orders are accepted preferably for calendar year i.e. January to December and are non-refundable.
- I enclose my Pay Order/Bank Draft No. ............. payable to Rector NUML (JCI Subscription), Islamabad, Pakistan.

Local orders are to be made by Pay Orders and Foreign orders by Bank Drafts

ANNUAL SUBSCRIPTION RATES (per issue) - Please select:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inland</th>
<th>Foreign</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pak. Rs.500/-</td>
<td>US$.30/-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Address to which the journal is to be sent

Name ...........................................................................................................................................

Address ......................................................................................................................................

...............................................................................................................................................

Institution .................................................................................................................................

Contact Number .................................................................

Email ..............................................................................................................................
CONTENTS

Research Papers

Tayyaba Tamim & Hana Tariq
Language Policy, Languages in Education and Physical Wellbeing

Mirza Muhammad Zubair Baig
The Question of Reclamation of “Ghost” Lives in J. M. Coetzee’s Foe

Aamir Shafi
Punjabi Parents’ Perception of Punjabi as their Children’s Mother Tongue

María Isabel Maldonado García & Ana Borges
Etymological and String Analysis of Portuguese-Urdu Shared Vocabulary

Editorial Office
Quality Enhancement Cell,
Ghazali Block Extension, National University of Modern Languages
Islamabad, Pakistan
Tel: +92-51-9257646 Ext 341 & 214

NUML JCI is indexed & abstracted by Proquest & Ebscohost

Subscription Rates (per issue)
Pakistan: Biannual: PKR 500/-
Overseas: Biannual: US$ 30